SEE FOLLOWING NOTE

VOIR NOTE CI-APRÈS

PARTS OF THE ORIGINAL DOCUMENT ARE OF POOR REPRODUCTIVE QUALITY.

MICROMEDIA LIMITED HAS ATTEMPTED TO PRODUCE THE BEST POSSIBLE COPY.

CERTAINES PARTIES DU DOCUMENT ORIGINAL SONT DE PIÈTRE QUALITÈ DE REPRODUCTION.

MICROMEDIA LTEE A ESSAYEE DE PROCURER LE MEILLEUR EXEMPLAIRE POSSIBLE.

House of Assembly
Nova Scotia

Report

Commission of Inquiry
on
Remuneration of Elected
Provincial Officials

November 24, 1989

Commission of Inquiry
on
Remuneration of Elected Provincial Officials

Commissioners:

George M. Mitchell, Q.C.
George L. White, LL.B.
Ian D. Robinson, CLU

Secretary to the Commission:
Joan M. Kelly

Post Office Box 2630
Station "M"
Halifax, N.S.
B3J 3N5

424-4432

November 24, 1989

The Honourable Arthur R. Donahoe
Speaker of the House of Assembly
Province House
Halifax, Nova Scotia

Dear Mr. Speaker:

We were appointed as Commissioners pursuant to Chapter 29 of the Statutes of Nova Scotia, 1983, to make an inquiry and a report respecting the indemnities, allowances and salaries to be paid under the House of Assembly Act and the Executive Council Act.

Having completed our inquiry, in fulfillment of the commission assigned, we respectfully submit the accompanying report.

Yours sincerely,

George M. Mitchell

George L. White

Ian D. Robinson

/ml

27\06608\0004\donahoe.let

NOVA SCOTIA

COMMISSION OF INQUIRY

ON

REMUNERATION OF ELECTED

PROVINCIAL OFFICALS

24 November 1989

90-01449/

TABLE OF CONTENTS

		Page
I.	INTRODUCTION	1
II.	INDEMNITIES, ALLOWANCES AND SALARIES; BACKGROUND CONSIDERATIONS	
	1. Basic Indemnities, Allowances and Salaries for M.L.A.'s and Ministers	3
	2. Additional Payments to members for Services in the House	4
	3. The Legislature and the Role of the M.L.A.	5
	4. Support for Legislators in Other Provinces	8
	5. Some Indicators of REcent Economic Changes in Nova Scotia	9
III.	REMUNERATION FOR M.L.A.'s	12
IV.	ADMINISTRATION AND SUPPORT, SERVICES AND FACILITIES FOR THE WORK OF PRIVATE MEMBERS AND OF CAUCUS OFFICES	15
V.	SUPPORT FOR LEADERS OF OPPOSITION PARTIES	20
VI.	SALARIES OF MEMBERS HOLDING OFFICE AND EXPENSES OF MEMBERS OF THE EXECUTIVE COUNCIL	21
VII.	LEGISLATIVE COMMITTEES AND FACILITIES SUPPORTING THE HOUSE	25
VIII.	SALARIES FOR OFFICERS OF THE HOUSE	27
IX.	CONCLUSION	29
X.	SUMMARY OF RECOMMENDATIONS	30
XI.	SUMMARY OF PROPOSALS	31

APPENDICES

A.	Footnotes	33
B.	Letter of Appointment of Commissioners with text of S. 43A of the *House of Assembly Act* as amended 1983, c.29	34
C.	Acknowledgements	36
D.	Internal Economy Board Regulations 1989	42
E.	Tables	54
F.	Principles relating to Remuneration and Support for Members and Ministers	60

INDEX TO TABLES IN THE REPORT

		Page
TABLE A	Acts passed by the Legislature, Nova Scotia (1983-1989)	7
TABLE B	Comparison of some changes in Earnings, Public Sector, Nova Scotia	10
TABLE C	Summary Record of Salaries paid to Designated Office Holders, 1986-1989	21
TABLE E-1	Summary Record of Indemnities, Allowances and Salaries for M.L.A.'s, Salaried Members and Members of the Executive Council in Nova Scotia, 1982-1989	54
TABLE E-2	Indemnities, Allowances and Salaries for Elected Members by Province 1989-1990	55
TABLE E-3	Summary of Additional Remuneration for Particular Responsibilities and for Committee Service in the Legislature by Province	56
TABLE E-4	Sitting Days per Session of the Nova Scotia Legislature 1970-1989	57
TABLE E-5	Average Salaries of Selected Public Sector Groups, Nova Scotia 1985-1989	58
TABLE E-6	Consumer Price Index for Canada (All Items) 1981-1989	59

NOTE: Requests for additional copies of this Report and those of previous Commissioners may be made to the Office of the Speaker, House of Assembly, Halifax, Nova Scotia.

I. INTRODUCTION

The House of Assembly Act by virtue of Section 43A[1] provides that the Speaker shall, on or before the first day of October in each year, appoint persons to make an inquiry and a report respecting indemnities, allowances and salaries to be paid under the House of Assembly Act, the Executive Council Act, and the Members' Retiring Allowances Act[2].

By way of a letter dated August 28, 1989, the Speaker appointed George M. Mitchell, George L. White, and Ian D. Robinson as Commissioners to carry out the inquiry required by the House of Assembly Act and the Executive Council Act.

By way of a separate letter dated August 28, 1989, the Speaker appointed George L. White and Ian D. Robinson as Commissioners to inquire and report on all matters arising with respect to the Members Retiring Allowances Act.

In order to assist the Commission in its duties it has sought comment, advice and assistance from a variety of sources. All of the Members currently serving in the House of Assembly were contacted and advice was sought from some former Members. A public hearing was held after two separate advertisements in all of the daily newspapers in the Province. Notice was also mailed to the Nova Scotia Federation of Labour, the Nova Scotia Union of Municipalities and several Boards of Trade and Chambers of Commerce in various areas of the Province. An oral and written submission was made by the Nova Scotia New Democratic Party.

The Commissioners have met with several members of the House of Assembly and with a number of public servants associated with the work of the House and the Executive Council.

The Commissioners' Report is divided into two sections, that is, "Recommendations", of the Commission which, pursuant to the provisions of Section 43A of the House of Assembly Act, have the same force as if they were passed by the legislature, and, "Proposals", which generally deal with matters that have been raised with the Commissioners but with respect to which they have no clear mandate to decide. The Report this year is not unlike those of past years, and there are contained in it as well as Recommendations a number of Proposals for consideration of the Speaker, Government, Members of the Legislature, and the Internal Economy Board.

In other years, the Commissioners have obtained recent information on remuneration and arrangements for support of the legislators in other provinces of Canada from the editors of an annual study, "Canadian Legislatures 1987-1988" published by Robert J. Fleming. This study was not available this year. The Secretary of the Commission, Mrs. Joan Kelley, has contacted each of the provincial Legislatures to obtain their most recent information respecting indemnities, allowances, and pension arrangements, and we have relied on this information.

II. INDEMNITIES, ALLOWANCES AND SALARIES: BACKGROUND CONSIDERATIONS

1. Basic Indemnities, Allowances and Salaries For M.L.A.'s and Ministers

During the calendar year 1989, a Member of the House of Assembly was entitled to an Annual Indemnity of $28,695 together with an annual expense allowance of $12,450 for a total basic remuneration of $41,145. Under the provisions of the Income Tax Act (Canada) the annual expense allowance is not considered taxable income to the Member, and can amount to 50% of a Member's annual indemnity.

In addition, during 1989 salaries were paid to certain Members in relation to the important offices they held, as follows:to the Premier $45,535; a Minister having charge of a Department (i.e., a "Minister with portfolio") $35,290; a Minister without portfolio up to $35,290; the Speaker $35,290; the Leader of the Opposition $35,290; the Deputy Speaker $17,650; and the Leader of a Recognized Party, other than the Opposition, $17,650. The recent history of basic indemnities, allowances and salaries paid to M.L.A.'s and salaried Members, since 1982 appears in Appendix E, Table E-1. A comparison of the 1989 arrangements with those prevailing in other provinces appears in Appendix E, Table E-2.

Under present provisions of s. 43A the recommendations of the Commission have the same force and effect as if enacted by the Legislature and have effect from the 1st day of January immediately following the year in which the persons are appointed to prepare the Report. Prior to 1984, annual indemnities and allowances for Members, salaries for Officers of the House and for the Leader of a Recognized Party were all prescribed under the House of

Assembly Act, while all salaries for the Premier and for the Ministers were prescribed under the Executive Council Act.

2. **Additional Payments to Members for Services in the House**

Some Members are assigned additional responsibilities important to the working of the House of Assembly and, consequently, they are entitled to additional remuneration for these responsibilities.

In 1989, such additional payments were as follows: House Leader ($5,000 per annum); Deputy House Leader ($3,000 per annum); House Leader of the Official Opposition ($2,000 per annum); Whip of each Party ($85 per Caucus Member in the House); and Caucus Chairperson of each Party ($85 per Caucus Member in the House). These levels have not varied since 1984, or earlier in some cases. They are presently established by regulation of the Legislature Internal Economy Board.

Somewhat similar arrangements prevail in other Legislatures in Canada. Appendix E, Table E-3 is a summary of the most recent information available to this Commission, which sets forth additional payments paid to elected Members for certain responsibilities in the various Provincial Legislatures.

In the 1986 report, your Commissioners dealt extensively with the question of committee fees and their integration into the Members annual indemnity. As had been noted in earlier reports to the Speaker, there was a strong feeling that the Chairman of a number of committees should be entitled to additional payments due to the extra work load and time and commitment with which they would be involved.

As authorized by the Internal Economy Board Regulations for 1989, a scale of payment to certain committee chairmen is as follows:

Law Amendments, Legislature Internal Economy Board and Special and Select Committees

- $1,500 for Chairman

Private and Local Bills, Public Accounts, Industry

- $1,000 for Chairman

All Other Committees

- $500 for Chairman

Members are paid a per diem fee of $100.00 plus travel and accommodation allowances for each day a committee meets when the House is not in session or outside of the Halifax Dartmouth Metropolitan area if the House is in session.

3. The Legislature and the M.L.A.

As we move into the 1990s, we note that the M.L.A. still has two basic roles. First, the Member is a legislator involved in the increasingly complex tasks of government. Second, the Member is called upon to assist and serve constituents in a multitude of ways and with all kinds of problems, and the Member must respond in a timely and efficient manner.

In the primary role, as legislator, changes in technology, social values, development issues and the rapidity of change itself have made the legislative function a more demanding vocation than it was even a few years ago. Continuing inter- relations of federal and provincial governments and their public policies in such a time of change place new demands on private Members, whether in government or in the opposition. The burdens are greater for the Premier

and for Ministers who are responsible for governing through the Legislature and for the administration of government. The role of leaders of opposition parties is also more onerous due to these changes.

The greater complexity of government is not only the result of increasing need for cooperation and coordination between levels of government but also for effective cooperation between the public and private sectors. M.L.A.'s are required to become familiar with and deal effectively with a wide range of issues and concerns.

Appendix E, Table E-4, sets out the pattern of legislatures sitting over the past two decades.

We note that during the annual session of the Legislature, the Members often sit on committees. As well, the Legislature itself may sit for 10 to 12 hours per day if House hours are extended. In 1988 there were 19 days during which the House hours were extended, and in 1989 there were 28 such days. The Members must also deal with their constituency responsibilities during the evenings and on weekends. Most Members are absent from their homes and families during the Legislature session which is a sacrifice to public service experienced by the families of all elected Members.

The table below shows the number of acts passed by elected Members for each of the last seven years.

TABLE A

ACTS PASSED BY THE LEGISLATURE, NOVA SCOTIA

	1983	1984	1985	1986	1987	1988	1989
Public	67	67	41	65	93	72	82
Total	100	90	72	104	127	78	109

In addition to their role in the House itself, Members also serve on standing, select or special committees. Members of the Executive Council and Officers of the House have continuing responsibilities for policy and administration even when the House is not in session. Opposition Members generally have responsibility for monitoring and commenting upon particular aspects of government policy and practice, and not only when the House is in session. Members of all parties in the House also meet in caucus throughout the year. Thus, in the legislative role, every Member of the House spends considerable time throughout the year on business of the province whether or not the Assembly is in session.

The second role of the M.L.A. is to assist and serve constituents in a multitude of ways. While the constituency "case load" may vary from one constituency to another, and among Members, this general role has continued to grow. Members often now maintain several hundred active files of constituents' problems and concerns. M.L.A.'s are expected to deal with all manner of problems including many that are primarily the concern of other levels of government. No doubt the same is true for other elected members of national or local governments, for all seek to serve constituents who cannot be expected to fully understand the responsibilities of each government in our complex federal society.

Service to constituents is rendered year round. For Ministers, assistance with this service is available through the Minister's office staff. For private Members assistance with this service is provided in part through services of the caucus office and in part by limited funds for secretarial assistance in the constituency and often by volunteer family members. For all Members from outside the Halifax-Dartmouth region service often results in a heavy "case load" of visits and calls on weekends during the period of the year when the House is in session, and regularly through the week when the House is not in session.

A recent phenomenon is that more Members are becoming "full-time Members".They have no second vocation and depend entirely on their income as Members to support themselves and their families. In the present legislature, approximately 80% of the Members are full-time M.L.A.'s.

The level of remuneration and of support to the M.L.A. must be sufficient to allow the Member to devote the time and effort required to perform the duties expected of him or her. It should be adequate to permit persons without private means to stand for election and to serve if elected and it should not result in significant financial hardship for those who serve. The principles relating to appropriate levels of remuneration and support set out in the report of an earlier Commission of Inquiry are attached in Appendix F, and we endorse these.

4. Support for Legislators in Other Provinces

The job of the M.L.A. is unlike any other trade or profession. Members must deal with an increasingly wide range of issues and concerns.The Member of the Assembly must act as legislator, negotiator, ombudsman, social worker, public relations officer and perform tasks at almost any hour of the day or night, often seven days a week and nearly 365 days a year.

It is a role with no job security beyond the next election, with the Member's tenure of office subject to public endorsement or rejection at the polls every three or four years.

We believe the work cannot be compared to any other job, except that of legislators elsewhere. Thus, there is merit in comparing the role and remuneration of Nova Scotia M.L.A.'s to elected Members in similar roles in other provinces. Appendix E, Table E-2, sets out latest information on the basic indemnity and expense allowance of M.L.A.'s in the ten provinces as well as the salaries of certain Members, and Table E-3 is a summary of additional payments for service in the provincial legislatures. This information was obtained by the Secretary to the Commission from all the provincial legislatures in Canada and is, in most cases, effective as of January 1, 1990, except for the Province of Prince Edward Island. This Province appoints a commission every four years and its latest report was for 1986.

So far as we can judge measures of workload, such as sitting days, bills passed, size of constituency, number of constituents and committees of the House, it would appear that Nova Scotia Members have a workload comparable to other M.L.A.'s in most provinces in Canada, with the exception of Ontario and Quebec.

As noted, we have carried out an investigation with respect to the indemnity and allowance that is paid to all other provincial legislators in Canada. Significant increases have taken place in Newfoundland, Alberta and British Columbia. As a result, the remuneration for Nova Scotia M.L.A.s has fallen well below the legislators remuneration in most of the other provinces of Canada, indeed lower than all provinces except Manitoba and Prince Edward Island.

5. Some Indicators of Recent Economic Changes in N.S.

Since the M.L.A.'s role cannot be compared directly with that of any other profession, trade or employment, direct comparisons of remuneration with other groups are inappropriate. Yet the trend of changes in remuneration for others in the province may be useful in considering possible change for M.L.A.'s.

In a number of our provinces and in the Federal Parliament, statutory provision is made for automatic annual change in remuneration for Members by formulae related to changes in provincial wages and salaries, or in public service salaries generally or in price or other indexes.

Some indicators of recent economic changes in Nova Scotia appear in Appendix E, Tables E-5 and E-6.

The following table summarizes comparative increases in rates of earnings of certain public sector groups from 1988 to 1989.

TABLE B

Comparison of Some Changes in Earnings, Public Sector, Nova Scotia

	1988 - 1989
Members' Integrated Annual Indemnity and Allowance	4%
Ministers' Salaries	4%
Public Sector Salaries:	
Civil Service Management Group	7.9%
Deputy Ministers	5.2%
Provincial Judges	30.9%
Teachers (Currently under negotiation)	N/A
Nurses (Currently under negotiation)	N/A

Another factor for comparison is the rate of inflation. As measured by changes in the Consumer Price Index for Canada, the inflation rate continued through 1989 at a level significantly below that prevailing in the early 1980s. As Appendix E, Table E-6 indicates, the percentage increase from December 1981 to September 1989 was approximately 45.7%. We note that over the same period this compares with increases in the integrated indemnity and allowance for M.L.A.'s of 25.8% and an increase in salaries of Ministers of approximately 41.2% for the same period. The annual increase in CPI for Canada for the latest month reported, September 1989, was 5.24% and for Halifax it was 5.35%.

In light of the various background considerations dealt with in this section of this report, we turn now to discussion of arrangements that we recommend should be made for indemnities, allowances and salaries for Members and for Ministers for 1990, and to some proposals that we believe warrant consideration. The recent history of basic indemnities, allowances and salaries paid to M.L.A.'s and salaried Members since 1982 appears in Appendix E, Table E-1.

III. REMUNERATION OF M.L.A.'S

As we indicated in earlier reports, we believe that it is extremely important that information relating to the salaries and indemnities, allowances, committee fees and other financial information relating to the Members of the Legislative Assembly be freely available to the general public. This is necessary to eliminate any perception in the eyes of the public that Members of the Legislative Assembly are receiving income about which the public is not aware.

We are pleased that Members of opposition parties have been included on the Internal Economy Board as, apart from the report of your Commissioners, this body is an important regulator of the fees and expenses of Members of the Legislative Assembly. All of the regulations and actions of this committee are now in the public domain.

While it is true that there are some Members of the House of Assembly who do receive remuneration from outside occupations or professions, it appears (as noted earlier in this report) that most Members are becoming full-time Members without any other source of income.

Notwithstanding that the Assembly only meets for approximately four months during the spring of the year, the Legislative Committees are meeting more frequently when the House is not in session. We expect this situation to continue.

Furthermore, all Members of the Assembly are required to spend a significant amount of time above and beyond what might be considered the normal working hours to provide assistance, information and help to their constituents.

As noted earlier in this Report, your Commissioners have conducted a survey of indemnities and allowances paid to other legislators in Canada, see Appendix "E", Table E-2.

A review of the table will illustrate that Nova Scotia legislators receive less income than legislators in all other provinces with the exception of Manitoba and Prince Edward Island.The Provinces of Quebec and Ontario represent somewhat different situations than the other provinces. We know, however, that the average legislator's salary in the Provinces of Manitoba, Saskatchewan, Alberta and British Columbia is approximately $47,000. per year.

Interestingly enough, the average legislator's salary in Nova Scotia, New Brunswick and Newfoundland is also $47,000. Prince Edward Island reviews its legislators' salaries every four years. The latest review was in 1986, thus its figures are not comparable. It is evident that with an annual income of $41,145., the Nova Scotia legislators are considerably behind the average paid to legislators in provinces which we consider to be generally comparable to Nova Scotia.

Considerable restraint has been exercised over legislator's salaries during the past several years. The increases have been: 1986 - 2%, 1987 - 2%, 1988 - 3%, and 1989 - 4%, or a four year total increase of 11%. During the same time period the CPI increased by 17.9%. The shortfall of past increases plus the CPI increase for 1989 of 5.35% generally indicates that a catch-up of almost 12% would be warranted. We do not think it appropriate for our M.L.A.'s to fall too far behind the increases in the cost of living.

The Income Tax Act of Canada provides that Members of a Legislative Assembly may receive an allowance for expenses of up to 50% of their annual indemnity. In Nova Scotia, this percentage has dropped in recent years. In British Columbia, Saskatchewan, Manitoba, New Brunswick and Newfoundland, the M.L.A.'s allowance is set in accordance with the Income Tax Act. We believe that this allowance in Nova Scotia should also be as provided by the Income Tax Act of Canada.

We would therefore recommend:

R-1 For the year 1990 a Member of the House of Assembly be paid an annual indemnity of $30,130.00 and an annual allowance for expenses of $15,065.00.

This represents a 5% increase in the indemnity resulting in a combined income of $45,195.00. While the overall increase for 1990 would be approximately 9.8%, it still results in an income level which is considerably less than the income received by M.L.A.'s in New Brunswick and Newfoundland and in most western provinces.

During the course of our enquiry, we received one suggestion relating to the severance provisions of s. 40A of the House of Assembly Act. Your Commission has decided not to make any changes to the provisions of this section at the present time.

IV. ADMINISTRATION AND SUPPORT SERVICES

The House of Assembly Act, s. 43, authorizes the Legislature Internal Economy Board to make regulations which provide support to Members for work in both their constituencies and Halifax. The regulations for 1989 are annexed hereto as Appendix "D". Administration for the payments to Members presently falls under the jurisdiction of the Board and is handled on a daily basis by the administrative staff of the Speaker's office.

The Commissioners have concluded that these funding provisions do not clearly fall within the meaning of "indemnities, allowances and salaries" about which we might make recommendations that would have to be implemented.

However during this inquiry our attention was drawn to several matters to which we shall refer without recommendation. As in past years we shall deal with these items by way of proposal which, we trust, will be considered by the Legislature Internal Economy Board in drafting any changes to their Regulations for 1990.

The measure of support which is currently provided to all Members of the House of Assembly are summarized hereunder although they are dealt with in more detail in Appendix "D". For purposes of expenses, Members are divided into two groups, that is, inside Members and outside Members. An outside Member is defined in the House of Assembly Act as a Member who is ordinarily resident within the meaning of the Elections Act, more than 25 miles distant from the place where the House of Assembly ordinarily sits.

In last year's report, we made extensive changes to the level of support provided to members for costs incurred in their constituency.The bulk of these costs relate to the maintenance of constituency offices which would include things like rent, secretarial help, and

equipment. These offices are now, by many Members, considered an essential element of their provision of services to their constituents. This is especially true for full-time Members.

The levels of support in 1989 were as follows:

(a) $2,200 for travel in the constituency of each Member who is not an outside Member;

(b) $3,200 for travel in the constituency of each outside Member;

(c) $300 monthly for constituency expenses without receipts;

(d) $1,600 monthly for constituency expenses with receipts for each Member;

(e) $3,500 for postage;

(f) 52 trips per constituency to the City of Halifax.

This year, your Commissioners have heard further representations with respect to office expense. Many Members believe that the funds provided are more than adequate. Other Members suggest (and indeed produce accounts) suggesting that to maintain a modest office the funds provided are not sufficient.

After having given the matter considerable thought and having reviewed the levels of support provided in other provinces, and presuming that the Internal Economy Board will continue, in its 1990 regulations, the changes made last year, we propose the following change for item "d" above:

P-1 The sum of $1,800 each month for constituency expenses including office space, secretarial assistance, telephone, etc., which must be supported by proper receipts and which may be claimed by each Member;

In last year's report, we proposed that the Internal Economy Board establish a policy with respect to the cost of equipment and furniture for constituency offices. We note that the Internal Economy Board has dealt with this problem in the 1989 regulation, Section 27.

Also in our report of last year, the Commission proposed that the Internal Economy Board take some action with respect to those Members who use rental accommodation in place of hotel rooms while attending sessions of the Legislature. The Internal Economy Board pays for hotel expense up to $75. per day whereas no payments were made to those Members who leased premises. We are advised that the Board now pays members who rent accommodation, on a prorated basis, depending upon the amount of time spent in Halifax. We are also advised by several members that they, in effect, receive payment of approximately $25. per night on this prorated basis.

It does appear that a minor injustice still exists.

We propose that:

P-2 Payment to outside Members with full-time leased accommodation in the Halifax-Dartmouth Metropolitan area shall be the lesser of the actual monthly expense for rent set out in any such lease or $80. multiplied by the number of nights authorized by regulations 7 and 28, for the same period of time.

The result of this proposal would be that those Members renting accommodation on a full-time basis would be reimbursed on the same basis as other M.L.A.'s who rent hotel accommodations when they are in Halifax.

We have had a number of representations this year dealing with the question of reimbursement of expenses of Members while in Halifax. After having given these concerns considerable thought, we have concluded that we would propose the following:

We propose that:

P-3 The Legislature Internal Economy Board amend its Regulations to provide that all lump sum expenses be increased by $5. per day and that reimbursement for accommodation be increased to a maximum of $80. per day.

In our last Report we dealt extensively with the question of support for Party Caucus

offices. It is the perception of the Committee that the level of support provided at the present time is adequate and presume that this will be continued by the Internal Economy Board.

Your Commissioners were directed, during their investigations, to a problem relating to certain staff in the office of the Leader of the Opposition, the Leader of the Recognized Party, the office of the Legislative Counsel and the Committee's Office, to the effect that certain staff members were incorrectly classified. As a matter of policy your Commission believes that such matters do not fall within its mandate.

Accordingly we propose that:

P-4 The Legislature Internal Economy Board consider and if deemed appropriate cause a review to be made of matters relating to the staffing and classification of employees in each of the party caucus offices and as well the offices of the Leader of the Official Opposition as well as the Leader of the Recognized Party.

P-5 The Legislature Internal Economy Board consider and if deemed appropriate cause a review to be made of all of the matters relating to the organization and administration of support facilities to the House of Assembly, including the role, responsibility, classification, salary levels and resources of the Clerk's Office, Speaker's Office, Office of the Legislative Counsel, Legislative Library, Legislative Committee's Office and other similar support facilities.

With respect to the provision of support services for the Independent Member, your Commissioners presume that those services already provided for such Member will be continued.

The Legislature Internal Economy Board Regulation No. 32 provides for expenses of those persons occupying the position of a critic of a department or agency of government which consists of permitting a critic to attend "not more than two conferences per year within the Province, which conferences are necessarily incidental to the duties of the critic". A number of representations have been made to your Commissioners which range from increasing the number of trips to four per year, to an unlimited travel budget for opposition departmental

critics.

These requests, as well as the arrangements made in last year's Regulations for the holding of four Caucus meetings outside the City of Halifax, generally reflect the phenomenon we noted earlier in this Report that approximately 80% of all Members are full-time Members. This does mean that M.L.A.s who are devoting full time to the business of being an M.L.A. do have more time available to serve their constituencies and, in the case of opposition Members, to make more in depth studies of the activities of government.While all of these activities are directed to improving the level of government for the people of this Province, we do not think it is appropriate that the travel of departmental critics be expanded to any great extent.

We would propose as follows:

P-6 That Rule 32 of the 1989 Legislative Internal Economy Board Regulations be amended to the extent that the word "conferences" be deleted and replaced by the word "meetings".

There were also suggestions from Members of the Opposition to the effect that they would like permission to have one or more of their Members establish Task Forces to consider matters of public interest in various parts of the province. While this idea has some merit, we can foresee a veritable Pandora's box opening up before us.

The Regulations of the Legislature Internal Economy Board now provide that each Caucus may hold four meetings outside of the City of Halifax. The cost of these trips are reimbursed by the Internal Economy Board. In order to accommodate the suggestion of Task Forces, we think the following would be appropriate.

We would propose as follows:

P-7 That Members of the Government Caucus, the Caucus of the Official Opposition, and the Caucus of each Recognized Party may, in lieu of one or more of their permitted Caucus meetings hold a Task Force meeting anywhere within the Province, the expenses of such Task Force to be reimbursed in accordance with the provisions of the Internal

Economy Board Regulations 13(2), (3) and (4) and Regulation 28, such Task Force being permitted to meet in one location only and for a maximum of two nights.

V. SUPPORT FOR LEADERS OF OPPOSITION PARTIES

The House of Assembly Act provides that the Leader of the Official Opposition is to have the benefit of office facilities, equipment, secretaries, a director of research, research assistants and senior assistant. The Legislature Internal Economy Board, by regulation, provides for reimbursement of travel and related expenses of the Leader of the Official Opposition.The regulations further allow that if the Leader of the Official Opposition is an outside Member, he is to receive an allowance equivalent to that provided to a Minister for living expenses within the City of Halifax. Additionally, the Leader of the Official Opposition is entitled to a leased motor vehicle on the same basis as a Minister.

The House of Assembly Act specifies that the Leader of a recognized party is to be provided with office facilities, a secretary, a research assistant, and a senior assistant. The regulations of the Board also make provision for reimbursement of travel and related expenses of the Leader of a recognized party. Such a "leader of a recognized party" is defined in s.43B as "the Leader in the House of any party represented by two or more Members other than the Premier or the Leader of the Opposition whose party was a "recognized party" in accordance with the Elections Act and had candidates standing for election for three quarters of the seats of Members in the House and whose party received ten percent or more of the votes officially recorded in the latest general election of Members of the House".

Your Commissioners would expect that the sort of assistance provided to Leaders of Opposition Parties would continue to be provided into the future.

VI. SALARIES OF MEMBERS HOLDING OFFICE AND EXPENSES OF MEMBERS OF THE EXECUTIVE COUNCIL

This section of the report pertains to remuneration and expenses for those who hold office pursuant to the Executive Council Act and to remuneration for those who hold office in the House of Assembly.

The Premier and Ministers of the Crown (including those without portfolio) are paid a salary for their offices in accordance with the Executive Council Act. The House of Assembly Act provides an annual salary for the Speaker, Deputy Speaker, Leader of the Opposition and the leader of a recognized party. The recent history of salaries for these offices is traced in the reports of earlier Inquiries of this nature. The summary record of salaries paid for these offices in recent years appears in Table C below.

TABLE C

SUMMARY RECORD OF SALARIES PAID TO DESIGNATED OFFICE HOLDERS

1986-1989

	1986	1987	1988	1989
Premier	$41,675	$42,510	$43,785	$45,535
Minister with Department	32,300	32,950	33,935	35,290
Minister without Portfolio	Up to 32,300	Up to 32,950	Up to 33,935	Up to 35,290
Speaker	32,300	32,950	33,935	35,290
Deputy Speaker	16,150	16,475	16,970	17,650
Leader of the Opposition	32,300	32,950	33,935	35,290

Leader of Recognized Party	16,150	16,475	16,970	17,650

In our previous Reports we have noted that the Premier was entitled to a representation allowance of $4,000.00 per year pursuant to the Regulations of the Legislature Internal Economy Board. This amount was provided to cover additional miscellaneous expenses that the Premier would normally encounter in the discharge of his duties. We have discovered that this amount has been considered as taxable income, tax having been deducted from this amount prior to its payment. Following normally accepted accounting principles, we believe that the Premier's income for 1989 should be restated to include this amount and we propose as follows:

P-8 That the 1989 salary of the Premier be restated to include the representation allowance and that such representation allowance not be included in future Internal Economy Board Regulations.

We recommend that salaries for the Members of the Executive Council and other Officers be increased by Five Percent (5%) and be established as follows:

R-2 For 1990 the salary of the Premier, under the Executive Council Act, be $52,012.

R-3 For 1990 the salary of a Minister having charge of a Department, under the Executive Council Act, be $37,055.

R-4 For 1990 the maximum possible salary for a Minister without portfolio, under the Executive Council Act, be $37,055.

R-5 For 1990 the salary of the Speaker, under the House of Assembly Act, be $37,055.

R-6 For 1990 the salary of the Deputy Speaker, under the House of Assembly Act, be $18,533.

R-7 For 1990 the salary for the Leader of the Opposition, under the House of Assembly Act, be $37,055 and for the Leader of a recognized party, under the House of Assembly Act, be $18,533.

For other salaried Members for whom salaries or payment for offices are provided under regulation, we recommend:

R-8 For 1990 the salary established by regulation of the Legislature Internal Economy Board for the House Leader, for the Deputy House Leader, for the House Leader of the Official Opposition, for the Whip of each Party and for the Caucus Chairperson of each Party, in each case, be the same as in 1989.

In accordance with s. 6 of the Executive Council Act, all Members of the Executive Council are entitled to payment to indemnify them for reasonable expenses incurred for travelling or otherwise in the discharge of official duties.

All those members of the Executive Council who are outside Members as defined in the House of Assembly Act, are entitled to an amount to reimburse them for travelling expenses between Halifax and the constituency and for actual expenses incurred as a result of being in Halifax while a member of the Council. One of the more important allowances provided for Ministers who are "outside Members" is an allowance for rental of accommodations in Halifax, in recognition of the fact that in most cases their service to the Province requires them to have a second residence. In 1989 up to $12,000 could be recovered for costs incurred for accommodation in Halifax by these Ministers.

As was stated in the 1985 Report, there are two major benefit programmes provided for the public service which have been made available to Members.

The medical plan for the public service has been made available to Members on the same basis as for public servants and so has the basic group life programme.

In our last two Annual Reports, your Commissioners have commented upon a long-term disability program for Members and the fact that such a program should be provided. We understand that this program is in the process of being arranged by government which incorporates a six month disability waiting period.

We recommend as follows:

R-9 That a long term disability plan for Members who are eligible in accordance with the rules of such plan, be established no later than January 1, 1990.

VII. LEGISLATIVE COMMITTEES AND FACILITIES SUPPORTING THE HOUSE

In 1989 the Standing Committees of the House of Assembly were Law Amendments, Private and Local Bills, Public Accounts, Economic Development, Internal Affairs, Human Resources, Resources, Community Services, and Veterans's Affairs and as well as a Special Committee on Rules and Procedures. We assume that with the new House, similar such committees or more will be struck.

In recognizing the expanding role of committees, the government has converted a large portion of the Dennis Building into first-class facilities for the holding of meetings of committees. One of the difficulties of the existing committee system as perceived by the Commissioners is that while the support staff provided for the use of the facilities is competent and diligent, its numbers may have become insufficient to handle all the demands placed upon them. For example, the Public Accounts Committee is an extremely important committee and its work over a period of time should be of considerable benefit to the public interest. It may well be necessary for this committee to have associated with it a full or part-time research person.

It is to be expected that the work of the committee meetings will expand in the future, and it is quite possible that, as has happened in other Legislative Assemblies across Canada, it may be necessary to consider a full time Clerk for the Legislature.

In our Report in 1988, this Commission proposed that the Internal Economy Board review the support staff needs of the committee office administration, and give consideration to providing further support staff where needed.

We still believe that further attention should be directed to the provision of appropriate

support staff for the important committees. It is to be noted that the full resources of the Office of the Legislative Counsel is provided to the Law Amendments Committee and the Private and Local Bills Committee.

As the committee support facilities have evolved, so has the role of the other key support facilities to the House. The duties and responsibilities of the Speaker's Office have increased significantly in recent years so this office is now responsible for administration of not only the House but many independent government commissions, task forces, agencies and bodies.

We hope that the Legislature Internal Economy Board will give some consideration to Proposals 4 and 5 noted earlier in this report which we think is an effective way to address some of the concerns which have been brought before us.

VIII. SALARIES FOR OFFICERS OF THE HOUSE

The House of Assembly Act, in Part VII, designates four Officers of the House of Assembly. These officers are the Chief Clerk, Assistant Clerk, Legislative Counsel and Sergeant-at-Arms. The Chief Clerk, Assistant Clerk and Legislative Counsel are designated by the Act as appointees of the Governor in Council and under the Public Service Act the Sergeant-at-Arms is appointed by the House.

The salaries for all of these officers are presently prescribed by regulation of the Legislature Internal Economy Board. In the case of the Legislative Counsel, historically the salary for this officer was fixed by Governor in Council. Following the Report of the Inquiry Commission of 1983, an Order in Council was passed enabling the salary of this officer to be set by the Legislature Internal Economy Board.

With regard to the other officers, subsection 43(3) of the House of Assembly Act provides these salaries to be set by regulation of the Board and the regulation provides that for 1989 the salary of the Chief Clerk is $38,480, for the Assistant Clerk is $32,448.

Your Commissioners understand that the Sergeant-at-Arms has resigned. A new Sergeant-at-Arms will be appointed shortly and the position will be changed from a part-time position to a full-time position. The new Sergeant-at-Arms will have greater responsibility and in particular will be responsible for the security of the Legislative Chamber and its environs. Considering the full-time nature of this position the Commissioners propose:

P-9 That the salary of the Sergeant-at-Arms be set for 1990 at the rate of $38,000.

In line with our general recommendations for salary increments, the Commissioners propose that:

P-10 The salaries of the Chief Clerk, and the Assistant Clerk, be reviewed by the Legislature Internal Economy Board and set for 1990 at a level of five percent (5%) above that established for 1989.

P-11 With respect to the salary of the Legislative Counsel, the Legislative Internal Economy Board consider the current remuneration of the Legislative Counsel and set such remuneration for 1990.

We also note that the House of Assembly Act, s.51A provides for the reimbursement to the officers of the House as may be authorized by the Speaker or other Member of the Legislature Internal Economy Board for reasonable expenses of travel accommodation or otherwise incurred while absent from their ordinary place of residence in connection with the business of the house or as a representative of the House or of the Province whether the House is in session or not.

IX. CONCLUSION

In the course of our Inquiry a variety of matters were brought to the attention of the Commissioners; not all of these have been dealt with or recorded in this Report. We do record our gratitude to the many who assisted us by oral or written submissions or by giving Commissioners the benefit of considered opinions on matters relevant to this Inquiry.

We believe that the recommended remuneration and the Long-Term Disability will be helpful to Members of the Legislature and will provide them with the level of income and benefits that already exist in many of the public and private employment sectors.

We continue to believe that it is good policy to make public all aspects that touch upon the indemnity and allowances of Members of the Legislature.

Your Commissioners also think it is appropriate that the salary level of M.L.A.'s and Cabinet Members should be adequate so that people of high quality will continue to offer themselves as candidates for election to the Nova Scotia House of Assembly.

X. SUMMARY OF RECOMMENDATIONS

The Commissioners make the following recommendations in their Report, after inquiry, respecting the indemnities, allowances and salaries to be paid under the House of Assembly Act and the Executive Council Act:

R-1 For the year 1990 a Member of the House of Assembly be paid an annual indemnity of $30,130 and an annual allowance for expenses of $15,065. (p.14)

R-2 For 1990 the salary of the Premier, under the Executive Council Act, be $52,012. (p.22)

R-3 For 1990 the salary of a Minister having charge of a Department, under the Executive Council Act, be $37,055. (p.22)

R-4 For 1990 the maximum possible salary for a Minister without portfolio, under the Executive Council Act, be $37,055. (p.22)

R-5 For 1990 the salary of the Speaker, under the House of Assembly Act, be $37,055. (p.22)

R-6 For 1990 the salary of the Deputy Speaker, under the House of Assembly Act, be $18,533. (p.22)

R-7 For 1990 the salary for the Leader of the Opposition, under the House of Assembly Act, be $37,050 and for the Leader of a recognized party, under the House of Assembly Act, be $18,533. (p.22)

R-8 For 1990 the salary established by regulation of the Legislature Internal Economy Board for the House Leader, for the Deputy House Leader, for the House Leader of the Official Opposition, for the Whip of each Party and for the Caucus Chairperson of each Party, in each case, be the same as in 1989. (p.23)

R-9 That a Long-Term Disability Plan for members who are eligible in accordance with the rules of such plan, be established no later than January 1, 1990. (p.24)

XI. SUMMARY OF PROPOSALS

The Commissioners consider that a number of matters which do not clearly fall within their commission "to make an enquiry and a report respecting the indemnities, allowances and salaries to be paid..." are worthy of further consideration by those responsible for the operations of the House of Assembly. While these are not recommendations to be implemented by the Speaker, the Commissioners, after inquiry, make these proposals:

P-1 The sum of $1,800 each month for constituency expenses including office space, secretarial assistance, telephone, etc., which must be supported by proper receipts and which may be claimed by each Member. (p.16)

P-2 Payment to outside Members with full-time leased accommodation in the Halifax-Dartmouth Metropolitan area shall be the lesser of the actual monthly expense for rent set out in any such lease or $80 multiplied by the number of nights authorized by regulations 7 and 28, for the same period of time. (p.17)

P-3 The Legislature Internal Economy Board amend its Regulations to provide that all lump sum expenses be increased by $5 per day and that reimbursement for accommodation be increased to a maximum of $80 per day. (p.17)

P-4 The Legislature Internal Economy Board consider and if deemed appropriate cause a review to be made of matters relating to the staffing and classification of employees in each of the party caucus offices and as well the offices of the Leader of the Official Opposition as well as the Leader of the Recognized Party. (p.18)

P-5 The Legislature Internal Economy Board consider and if deemed appropriate cause a review to be made of all of the matters relating to the organization and administration of support facilities to the House of Assembly, including the role, responsibility, classification, salary levels and resources of the Clerk's Office, Speaker's Office, Office of the Legislative Counsel, Legislative Library, Legislative Committee's Office and other similar support facilities. (p.18)

P-6 That Rule 32 of the 1989 Legislature Internal Economy Board Regulations be amended to the extent that the word "conferences" be deleted and replaced by the word "meetings". (p.19)

P-7 That Members of the Government Caucus, the Caucus of the Official Opposition, and the Caucus of each Recognized Party may, in lieu of one or more of their permitted caucus meetings, hold a Task Force meeting anywhere within the Province, the expenses of such Task Force to be reimbursed in accordance with the provisions of the Internal Economy Board Regulations 13(2), (3) and (4) and Regulation 28, such Task Force being permitted to meet in one location only and for a maximum of two nights. (p.19)

P-8 That the 1989 salary of the Premier be restated to include the representation allowance and that such representation allowance not be included in future Internal Economy Board Regulations. (p.22)

P-9 That the salary of the Sergeant-at-Arms be set for 1990 at the rate of $38,000. (p.27)

P-10 The salaries of the Chief Clerk and the Assistant Clerk be reviewed by the Legislature Internal Economy Board and set for 1990 at a level of five percent (5%) above that established for 1989. (p.28)

P-11 With respect to the salary of the Legislative Counsel, the Legislature Internal Economy Board consider the current remuneration of the Legislative Counsel and set such remuneration for 1990. (p.28)

APPENDIX "A"
FOOTNOTES

1. House of Assembly Act, R.S.N.S. 1967, c. 128, s. 43A(3)(4) as amended 1983, c. 29. (For text of s. 43A see Appendix "B").

2. See Appendix "B" for letter appointing Commission, with a copy of s. 43A of the House of Assembly Act, as enacted 1983, c. 29.

3. Information provided by the Office of the Speaker.

APPENDIX "B"

The Speaker

House of Assembly
Nova Scotia

PO Box 1617
Halifax, Nova Scotia
B3J 2Y3

902 424-5707

August 28, 1989

Mr. George White, LL.B.
Patterson Kitz
Barristers and Solicitors
P. O. Box 1068
Truro, Nova Scotia
B2N 5B9;

Mr. Ian Robinson
6313 Cornwall Street
Halifax, Nova Scotia
B3H 2J2

Mr. George Mitchell, Q.C.
Cox, Downie & Goodfellow
Barristers and Solicitors
P. O. Box 2380, Station M
Halifax, Nova Scotia
B3J 3E5; and

Gentlemen:

This will confirm your appointment as Commissioners pursuant to Chapter 29 of the Statutes of Nova Scotia, 1983, to make an enquiry and a report respecting the indemnities, allowances and salaries to be paid under the House of Assembly Act and the Executive Council Act.

I thank you for your willingness to undertake these duties and can assure you of the full co-operation of the Office of the Speaker in carrying out your work.

I look forward to receiving your report on or before December 1, 1989 as required by the Act.

Yours very truly,

Arthur R. Donahoe
Speaker

ARD:nk

AN ACT TO AMEND CHAPTER 128
OF THE REVISED STATUTES, 1967,
THE HOUSE OF ASSEMBLY ACT

(Assented to the 1st day of June, A.D. 1983)

Be it enacted by the Governor and Assembly as follows:

1 Section 43A of Chapter 128 of the Revised Statutes, 1967, the House of Assembly Act, is repealed and the following Section substituted therefor:

43A (1) The Speaker, after appropriate consultation, shall on or before the first day of October in each year appoint persons to make an inquiry and a report respecting the indemnities, allowances and salaries to be paid under this Act, the Executive Council Act and the Members' Retiring Allowances Act.

(2) The persons appointed pursuant to subsection (1) shall have all the powers and privileges and immunities of a commissioner under the Public Inquiries Act and shall complete their inquiry and deliver their report containing recommendations to the Speaker on or before the first day of December in the year in which they are appointed.

(3) The Speaker, upon receipt of the report containing the recommendations of the persons appointed pursuant to subsection (1), shall cause the recommendations to be implemented and they shall have the same force and effect as if enacted by the Legislature and shall be in substitution for provisions of this Act, the Executive Council Act and the Members' Retiring Allowances Act, as the case may be.

(4) The recommendations shall apply, from the first day of January immediately following the year in which the persons are appointed to make the report, until subsequently changed.

APPENDIX "C"

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

The Commissioners gratefully acknowledge the contributions of those many individuals and organizations who made submissions to them or were helpful when consulted in the course of the Inquiry.

During the course of the Inquiry, advertisements, on two occasions, were placed in all the daily newspapers in Nova Scotia to advise the general public of the Commission's work and to invite submissions.

Written notice was sent to the Nova Scotia Federation of Labour, the Nova Scotia Union of Municipalities and twelve of the Boards of Trade in the province.

A Public Hearing was held in the Red Chamber of Province House on Wednesday, October 25, 1989. This year one presentation was made to the Commission.

However, the Commission also met with or exchanged correspondence with a considerable number of people. We acknowledge the very helpful assistance of the following persons:

Professor Agar Adamson, Department of Political Science,
Acadia University

Mr. Glen Bagnell,
(former M.L.A.)

Mr. James Barkhouse, M.L.A..
Lunenburg East

Mr. J. Bernard (Bernie) Boudreau, M.L.A.,
Cape Breton The Lakes

Mr. D. Ross Bragg, M.L.A.
Cumberland West

Mr. Guy Brown, M.L.A.
Cumberland Centre

Honourable John M. Buchanan, P.C., Q.C., Premier, M.L.A.
Halifax Atlantic

Mr. Rodney Caley
Chief Editor of Debates
Hansard Reporting Services

Mr. Joseph H. (Joe) Casey, M.L.A.
Digby

Honourable Arthur R. Donahoe, Q.C.,
Speaker of the House, M.L.A.
Halifax Citadel

Honourable Terence R. B. Donahoe, Q.C.
Chairman, Management Board, M.L.A.
Halifax Cornwallis

Mr. Gerald J. Doucet, Q.C.
(former M.L.A.)

Mr. Percy J. Fleet
Superintendent of Pension Benefits
Department of Finance

Dr. J. William Gillis, M.L.A.
Antigonish

Mr. W. John (Jack) Hawkins, M.L.A.
Hants East

Mr. Donald Hubley
Administrative Supervisor
Office of the Speaker

Ms. Sandra Jolly, M.L.A.
Dartmouth North

Mrs. Joan M. Kelly
Legislature Committees Office

Honourable Greg Kerr
Minister of Finance, M.L.A.
Annapolis West

Mr. Derrick J. Kimball, M.L.A.
Kings South

Honourable John G. Leefe
Minister of the Environment, M.L.A.
Queens

Mr. Edward F. (Ed) Lorraine, M.L.A.
Colchester North

Mr. Roderick MacArthur
Chief Clerk of the House

Mr. Kenneth MacAskill, M.L.A.
Victoria

Mr. Michael J. MacDonald
(former M.L.A.)

Mr. Paul MacEwan, M.L.A.
Cape Breton Nova

Honourable J. A. (Jack) MacIsaac
Minister of Mines and Energy, M.L.A.
Pictou Centre

Mr. Vincent J. MacLean
Leader of the Opposition, M.L.A.
Cape Breton South

Mr. Richard Mann, M.L.A.
Richmond

Honourable Joel R. Matheson, Q.C., M.L.A.
Halifax Bedford-Basin

Mrs. Alexa McDonough
Leader, New Democratic Party, M.L.A.
Halifax Chebucto

Mrs. Mildred Millar
Halifax, N. S.
(Private Citizen)

Mr. Gerald J. O'Malley, M.L.A.
Halifax Needham

Mr. S. Myles Rector
Director of Administration
Office of the Speaker

Mr. Ross Shephard
Civil Service Commission

Mr. Gordon Sturdy
Director, Public Service Pension Division
Department of Finance

Mr. James Vaughan
(Former M.L.A.)

Mrs. Maureen Vine
Vice-President
Nova Scotia New Democratic Party

Mr. Graham D. Walker, Q.C.
Chief Legislative Counsel

The comparative study, Canadian Legislatures, General Editor, Robert J. Fleming, was not published in 1989. It was, therefore, necessary to contact the provinces to obtain the information annually provided in Mr. Fleming's comprehensive overview.

The Commissioners wish to thank and acknowledge the assistance and cooperation of the numerous government offices within the Provinces for the information they forwarded.

We would particularly extend our appreciation to the following individuals.

Mr. W. J. David McNeil
Clerk of the Legislative Assembly
Alberta

Ms. Elaine N. Dunbar
Administrator - Office of the Speaker
British Columbia

Ms. Joan McMillan
Secretary to the Clerk of the House
British Columbia

Mr. W. H. Remnant
Clerk of the Legislative Assembly
Manitoba

Mr. David L. E. Peterson
Clerk of the Legislative Assembly
New Brunswick

Mr. Bill Murray
Office of the Clerk
Newfoundland

Mr. Bill Vincent
Executive Council Office
Newfoundland

Ms. Gayle Laws
Administrative Assistant, Office of the Clerk
Ontario

Mr. Charles MacKay
Committee Clerk
Prince Edward Island

Mr. Gilbert L'Heureux
Directorate for Parliamentary Relations
National Assembly
Quebec

Mrs. Marilyn Borowski
Saskatchewan Legislative Library
Saskatchewan

Ms. Rose Zeir
Saskatchewan Legislative Library
Saskatchewan

The Commissioners acknowledge the assistance in their work of S. Myles Rector and Don Hubley, Office of the Speaker and Ms. Joan Kelly, Legislature Committees office

APPENDIX "D"

LEGISLATURE INTERNAL ECONOMY BOARD REGULATION

CITATION

1 This Regulation may be cited as *Internal Economy Board Regulation 1989*.

AUTHORITY

2 This Regulation is made by the Legislature Internal Economy Board, pursuant to Section 43 of the *House of Assembly Act*, Chapter 128 of the Revised Statutes, 1967, as that Section is enacted by Chapter 39 of the Acts of 1974 and amended by Chapter 22 of the Acts of 1978-79 and Chapter 28 of the Acts of 1982, subsection (2) of Section 40 of the *House of Assembly Act*, as that subsection is enacted by said Chapter 39 and amended by said Chapters 22 and 28, subsection (1) of Section 40B of the *House of Assembly Act*, as that subsection is enacted by said Chapter 22 and amended by said Chapter 28, subsection (7) of Section 42 of the *House of Assembly Act*, as that subsection is enacted by said Chapter 39 and amended by said Chapter 22, and Section 6A of the *Executive Council Act*, as that Section is enacted by Chapter 24 of the Acts of 1982.

INTERPRETATION

3 Unless otherwise stated, in this Regulation,

(a) "economy air fare" does not include expenses incurred for the private charter of aeroplanes;

(b) "recognized party" means a party represented by two or more members and which is a recognized party in accordance with the *Elections Act* and had candidates standing for election for three quarters of the seats of members in the House and which received ten per cent or more of the votes officially recorded in the latest general election of the members of the House; and

(c) other words, phrases and expressions have the same meaning as in the *House of Assembly Act*.

HOUSE INDEMNITY-ALLOWANCE-TRAVEL-EXPENSE

Indemnity-Allowance-Salary

4 (1) Each member of the House is entitled during the year 1989 to receive a member's indemnity and allowance in four equal instalments, or where the member so requests in writing of the Chairman of the Legislature Internal Economy Board, in twelve or twenty-six equal instalments, each instalment being paid at equally spaced intervals throughout the year.

(2) The Clerk, the Assistant Clerk and the Sergeant-at-Arms are eligible to draw their salaries in the same manner as the members of the House of Assembly.

Franking

5 Each member of the House is entitled to receive $3,500.00 in substitution for the franking privilege and in lieu of expenses incurred on account of postage.

Outside Member Travel

6 Subject to Section 34, each outside member, except the member of the Executive Council holding the recognized position of Premier or a member of the Executive Council having charge of a department or the member occupying the recognized position of Leader of the Opposition or a leader of a recognized party, is entitled to reimbursement for actual travelling expenses calculated in accordance with Section 35 and incurred in 1989 between the place where the outside member is ordinarily resident and the City of Halifax to attend sittings of the House.

Outside Member Allowance

7 Each outside member, except the member of the Executive Council holding the recognized position of Premier or a member of the Executive Council having charge of a department or the member occupying the recognized position of leader of the Opposition or a leader of a recognized party, is entitled for attending a sitting of the House to

(a) an amount of $50.00 on account of expenses, without receipts, for each day that the outside member is in attendance at the House while the House is in session; and

(b) reimbursement in addition to that authorized by clause (a) for expenses,

(i) with proper receipts for sleeping accommodation charges only, or

(ii) notwithstanding Sections 6 and 34, for travel by the shortest and most convenient route between the place where the outside member is ordinarily resident and the place where the House ordinarily sits at the rate set out in Section 35,

incurred in attending the House while it is in session to a maximum of $75.00 per day.

Non-Outside Member and Outside Member of Executive Council Allowance

8 Each non-outside member, and each outside member who is a member of the Executive Council or the member occupying the recognized position of Leader of the Opposition or a leader of a recognized party and not entitled to submit a claim pursuant to Section 7, is entitled to an amount of $35.00, without receipts, for expenses for each day that the member is in attendance at the House while the House is in session.

Committee Fee

9 (1) The Chairman and each member of each Standing, Select and Special Committee of the House and the Legislature Internal Economy Board is entitled to receive a payment of $100.00 for each day on which the member attends a meeting of a Committee or the Board when the House is not sitting or the meeting is held outside the Halifax-Dartmouth metropolitan area.

(2) Notwithstanding subsection (1), no member shall receive more than one payment pursuant to subsection (1) for a day for attending more than one meeting of a Standing, Select or Special Committee of the House or the Legislature Internal Economy Board on the same day at the same place or, in the case of the Halifax-Dartmouth metropolitan area, in the Halifax-Dartmouth metropolitan area.

Committee Chairmen

10 The Chairman of each Standing Committee, each Select Committee and each Special Committee of the House is entitled to payment as follows:

(a) Law Amendments Committee - $1,500.00;

(b) Private and Local Bills Committee, Industry Committee and Public Accounts Committee - $1,000.00;

(c) all other Standing Committees of the House - $500.00;

(d) each Special Committee and each Select Committee - $1,500.00.

Committee Expenses

11 (1) For attendance at a meeting referred to in Section 9, the Chairman or member is entitled to receive reimbursement for

(a) actual expenses incurred in respect of accommodation, meals and other reasonable expenses incurred for the purpose of attending the meeting; and

(b) travelling expenses calculated in accordance with Section 34.

(2) Sleeping accommodation charges incurred and claimed pursuant to subsection (1) shall

(a) be accompanied by proper receipts; and

(b) not exceed the government rate for the establishment where the member stayed.

House Leaders

12 (1) A payment of $5,000.00 shall be made to the House Leader.

(2) A payment of $3,000.00 shall be made to the Deputy House Leader.

(3) A payment of $2,000.00 shall be made to the person recognized by the Speaker as occupying the position of House Leader of the Official Opposition.

(4) The Whip of each recognized party of the House shall receive a payment determined by multiplying the number of members of the party by $85.00.

(5) The Caucus Chairman of each recognized party of the House shall receive a payment determined by multiplying the number of members of the party by $85.00.

(6) In this Section, "member" means a duly elected member of the House but does not include the Speaker.

(7) If a payment is made pursuant to this Section to a member in the capacity of House Leader, Deputy House Leader, House Leader of the Official Opposition, Whip or Caucus Chairman, no further payment may be made pursuant to this Section in respect of that position.

CAUCUS

13 (1) In order to promote the intent of the *House of Assembly Act* with respect to support services for caucus offices during the year 1989, a sum shall be paid, at such level as is determined from time to time by the Legislature Internal Economy Board, to each caucus office set forth below sufficient to provide

(a) the Government Caucus Office with six secretaries, a Director of Research, an Assistant Researcher and an Office Manager;

(b) the Official Opposition Caucus Office with seven secretaries, four researchers, one receptionist and one Office Manager; and

(c) the caucus of the recognized party, namely the New Democratic Party with one secretary,

and such further sum as is determined from time to time by the Legislature Internal Econony Board in accordance with the budget approved by the House of Assembly .

(2) Members of the Government Caucus, members of the Caucus of the Official Opposition and members of the caucus of each recognized party are eligible for reimbursement, pursuant to subsections (3) and (4), for a maximum of four trips to attend Caucus meetings held in the Province outside the City of Halifax during the year 1989.

(3) A member attending a caucus meeting pursuant to subsection (2) is entitled to receive reimbursement for

(a) an amount of $50.00 on account of expenses, without receipts, for meals and other reasonable expenses incurred for the purpose of attending the meeting or actual expenses for meals and other reasonable expenses;

(b) actual expenses incurred in respect of accommodation; and

(c) travelling expenses calculated in accordance with Section 34.

(4) Sleeping accommodation charges incurred and claimed pursuant to subsection (3) shall

(a) be accompanied by proper receipts; and

(b) not exceed the government rate for the establishment where the member stayed.

Caucus Chairmen - Expenses

14 Where the Chairman of a Caucus is an outside member, that member is entitled to claim and to be paid, in addition to any other expenses allowed the Chairman, the same allowance and reimbursement authorized for an outside member for twelve return trips between the place where the Chairman is ordinarily resident and the City of Halifax.

PREMIER

Representation Allowance

15 A representation allowance in the amount of $4,000.00 shall be paid to the Premier of Nova Scotia for the period from January 1, 1989, to December 31, 1989.

LEADER OF OPPOSITION

Expenses within the Province

16 The member occupying the recognized position of Leader of the Official Opposition, in carrying out official duties within the Province, is entitled to be reimbursed for actual and reasonable expenses incurred for accommodation, meals, travel and incidentals incurred by the Leader and one assistant.

Special Travel

17 In addition to the entitlement authorized by Section 29, the Leader of the Official Opposition is entitled to be reimbursed for actual and reasonable expenses incurred for accommodation, meals, travel and incidentals incurred by the Leader and one assistant in carrying out official duties outside the Province on two separate occasions during the period from January 1, 1989, to December 31, 1989, subject to the restriction that on each occasion reimbursement shall not exceed expenses incurred for travel that includes more than three nights accommodation.

Living Allowance

18 The member occupying the recognized position of Leader of the Official Opposition, as an outside member, shall receive an allowance equivalent to that provided pursuant to the *Executive Council Act* to members of the Executive Council for living expenses within the City of Halifax.

Motor Vehicle

19 The member occupying the recognized position of Leader of the Official Opposition is entitled to a leased motor vehicle on the same basis as is a member of the Executive Council for a government leased or purchased motor vehicle.

LEADER OF RECOGNIZED PARTY

Expenses within the Province

20 A leader of a recognized party in carrying out official duties within the Province is entitled to be reimbursed for actual and reasonable expenses for accommodation, meals, travel and incidentals incurred by the leader and one assistant.

Special Travel

21 In addition to the entitlement authorized by Section 29, the leader of a recognized party is entitled to be reimbursed for actual and reasonable expenses incurred for accommodation, meals, travel and incidentals incurred by the leader in carrying out official duties outside the Province on two separate occasions during the period from January 1, 1989, to December 31, 1989, subject to the restriction that on each occasion reimbursement shall not exceed expenses incurred for travel that includes more than three nights accommodation.

MEMBER FOR CAPE BRETON NOVA

Support Services

22 (1) The member for Cape Breton Nova shall be provided at the Dennis Building in the City of Halifax with

(a) office space not exceeding three hundred square feet;

(b) one secretary at the Civil Service classification AS(6);

(c) office furniture necessary to furnish the office for the member and one secretary;

(d) one telephone line;

(e) one typewriter; and

(f) reasonable postage.

(2) Should there be any question arising from subsection (1) in respect of the office of the member for Cape Breton Nova concerning

(a) the selection of space;

(b) the level of the secretary within the AS(6) classification;

(c) the selection or amount of furniture;

(d) the selection of a typewriter; or

(e) reasonable postage,

such question shall be determined by the Chairman of the Legislature Internal Economy Board.

(3) The member for Cape Breton Nova may incur long distance telephone charges for telephone calls made from the office telephone in respect of House or constituency business.

CHIEF CLERK

Salary

23 The Chief Clerk shall be paid a salary of $38,480.00 per annum.

ASSISTANT CLERK

Salary

24 The Assistant Clerk shall be paid a salary of $32,448.00 per annum.

SERGEANT-AT-ARMS

Salary

25 The Sergeant-at-Arms shall be paid a salary of $21,580.00 per annum.

CONSTITUENCY MATTERS

Travel

26 (1) Each member of the House who is not an outside member is entitled to receive $2,200.00 in lieu of expenses incurred on account of travel within the member's constituency.

(2) Each member of the House who is an outside member is entitled to receive $3,200.00 in lieu of expenses incurred on account of travel within the member's constituency.

Services

27 (1) Each member of the House is entitled to receive the sum of $300.00 per month in lieu of expenses incurred on account of services to that member's constituency and a further sum not exceeding $1,600.00 per month for expenses accounted for by proper receipt and incurred on account of services in that member's constituency for the provision of office space, meeting places, equipment, telephone, telephone answering services, advertising and secretarial services.

(2) Where the maximum amount that may be claimed pursuant to subsection (1) is not claimed in any month the unclaimed balance may be claimed in a subsequent month.

(3) Expenses in excess of $500 per year incurred for the purchase of office furniture and equipment are not expenses for which a member may be reimbursed pursuant to this Section.

(4) Expenses incurred for the lease or the lease-purchase of office furniture and equipment are expenses for which a member may be reimbursed pursuant to this Section.

Attendance at Halifax

28 (1) Subject to Section 34, each outside member, except the member of the Executive Council holding the recognized position of Premier or a member of the Executive Council having charge of a department or the member occupying the recognized position of Leader of the Opposition or a leader of a recognized party, is entitled to

(a) an allowance of $50.00 on account of expenses, without receipts, for each day; and

(b) reimbursement in addition to that authorized by clause (a) for travelling expenses calculated in accordance with Section 35 and expenses for sleeping accommodation charges incurred,

for return trips between the place where the member is ordinarily resident and the City of Halifax to attend in Halifax other than to attend a sitting of the House or one of its committees.

(2) Sleeping accommodation charges incurred and claimed pursuant to subsection (1) shall

(a) be accompanied by proper receipts;

(b) not be for more than two nights accommodation unless approved in advance by the Chairman of the Legislature Internal Economy Board; and

(c) not exceed the government rate for the establishment where the member stayed.

Attendance at Ottawa

29 (1) Each member is entitled to

(a) an allowance of $75.00 on account of expenses, without receipts, for each day; and

(b) reimbursement in addition to that authorized by clause (a) for economy air fare, normal airline ground transportation and expenses for sleeping accommodation charges incurred,

for two return trips between the place where the member is ordinarily resident and the City of Ottawa to attend in Ottawa on constituency business.

(2) Sleeping accommodation charges incurred and claimed pursuant to subsection (1) shall

(a) be accompanied by proper receipts;

(b) not be for more than two nights accommodation; and

(c) not exceed the government rate for the establishment where the member stayed.

Attendance Outside the Province Other than Ottawa

30 (1) Where a member is not reimbursed pursuant to Section 29 for any return trips between the place where the member is ordinarily resident and the City of Ottawa on constituency business, that member is entitled to

(a) an allowance of $75.00 on account of expenses, without receipts, for each day; and

(b) reimbursement, in addition to that authorized by clause (a), for economy air fare, normal airline ground transportation and expenses for sleeping accommodation charges incurred,

for one return trip between the place where the member is ordinarily resident and another place in Canada outside the Province to attend that other place on constituency business.

(2) Sleeping accommodation charges incurred and claimed pursuant to subsection (1) shall

(a) be accompanied by proper receipts;

(b) not be for more than two nights accommodation; and

(c) not exceed the government rate for the establishment where the member stayed.

(3) Notwithstanding subsections (1) and (2), the member is not entitled to an amount pursuant to this Section for economy air fare charges in excess of that to which the member would have been entitled pursuant to Section 29.

Other Attendance Outside the Province

31 (1) Where a member is not reimbursed pursuant to Section 29 for more than one return trip between the place where the member is ordinarily resident and the City of Ottawa on constituency business, that member is entitled to

(a) an allowance of $75.00 on account of expenses, without receipts, for each day; and

(b) reimbursement, in addition to that authorized by clause (a), for economy air fare, normal airline ground transportation and expenses for sleeping accommodation charges incurred,

for one return trip between the place where the member is ordinarily resident and another place in Canada outside the Province to attend that other place on constituency business.

(2) Sleeping accommodation charges incurred and claimed pursuant to subsection (1) shall

(a) be accompanied by proper receipts;

(b) not be for more than two nights accommodation; and

(c) not exceed the government rate for the establishment where the member stayed.

(3) Notwithstanding subsections (1) and (2), the member is not entitled to an amount pursuant to this Section for economy air fare charges in excess of one-half of that to which the member would have been entitled pursuant to Section 29.

Expenses of Critics

32 Persons occupying the position of critic of a Department or agency of Government are entitled to reimbursement for actual and reasonable expenses for accommodation, meals, travel and incidentals incurred by the critic for attending not more than two conferences per year within the Province which conferences are necessarily incidental to the duties of the critic if prior approval of the Chairman of the Legislature Internal Economy Board is obtained prior to the incurring of the expenses.

Legislature Internal Economy Board

33 (1) The Chairman of the Legislature Internal Economy Board is entitled to a payment of $1,500.00.

(2) The Chairman and each member of the Legislature Internal Economy Board is entitled to expenses for meetings of the Legislature Internal Economy Board on the same basis and in the same manner as a member of a committee reimbursed pursuant to Section 11.

GENERAL

Restriction

34 No member shall be reimbursed for travel expenses authorized by Sections 6, 13 and 28 in excess of fifty-two return trips in 1989 between the place where the member is ordinarily resident and the City of Halifax to attend in Halifax, other than for attendance at a meeting of a Select Committee, a Special Committee or a Standing Committee.

Calculation of Travel Expense

35 Each outside member of the House, the member occupying the recognized position of Leader of the Opposition and a leader of a recognized party entitled under the *House of Assembly Act* to receive travelling expenses is entitled to be reimbursed for claimed travelling expenses incurred out of the Consolidated Fund of the

Province for travel by the shortest and most convenient route between the place where the member is ordinarily resident and the place where the House ordinarily sits or the Committee is meeting at

(a) the rate of 42 cents per mile or 26.2 cents per kilometre; or

(b) the cost of economy air fare plus normal airline ground transportation.

Request for Reimbursement

36 A person who makes a request for payment or reimbursement shall

(a) make the request in writing on the form provided by the Legislature Internal Economy Board;

(b) make the request within six months from the time the payment or claim for which reimbursement is made was incurred or became eligible to be paid;

(c) sign the request and certify that the request is correct; and

(d) forward the request to the office of the Speaker.

Limitation on Reimbursement

37 Notwithstanding anything contained in this Regulation, no member may claim for reimbursement an expense

(a) for which the member is reimbursed pursuant to another regulation or enactment;

(b) paid to the member's spouse, child, parent, brother or sister;

(c) paid to a person living in the same dwelling, as a member of the same household;

(d) paid to any business or on account of property in which the member or those persons mentioned in clause (b) or (c) have an ownership interest.

Payment Approval

38 (1) Directions for payment of indemnities, allowances, payments or reimbursements and approval of requests for payment or reimbursement shall be issued or made by the Chairman of the Legislature Internal Economy Board, the Vice-chairman or a person designated by the Chairman.

(2) The person who approves a request for payment or reimbursement has the authority to reduce or increase the amount of the payment or reimbursement claimed where that person determines that the amount claimed is in error.

Application

39 All Sections of this Regulation apply from the first day of January, 1989, to the thirty-first day of December, 1989, and are a replacement for provisions in a previous Regulation to the extent that it would otherwise apply to this period.

Approved by the Legislature Internal Economy Board at Halifax, Nova Scotia this 6th day of December, 1988.

Hon. Arthur R. Donahoe, Q.C.
Chairman

APPENDIX "E"

TABLE E-1

TABLE 2
SUMMARY OF INDEMNITIES, ALLOWANCES AND SALARIES FOR
M.L.A.'s SALARIED MEMBERS AND MEMBERS OF THE EXECUTIVE COUNCIL IN NOVA SCOTIA

1982 - 1989

YEAR	Annual Indemnity	Annual Expense Allowance	Speaker	Deputy Speaker	Leader of Opposition	Leader of Recognized Party	Minister without Portfolio	Minister with Portfolio	Premier
1982	$16,400	$ 8,200	$15,000	$ 7,500	$25,000	$10,000	$ 7,500 - 25,000	$25,000	$32,000
1983	$18,656*	$ 9,328	$29,150	$14,575	$29,150	$14,575	$ 7,500 - 29,150	$29,150	$37,630
1984	$19,400*	$ 9,700	$30,300	$15,150	$30,300	$15,150	$ 7,500 - 30,300	$30,300	$39,511
1985	$20,280*	$10,140	$31,670	$15,835	$31,670	$15,835	$ 7,500 - 31,670	$31,670	$40,860
1986	$27,315	$10,340	$32,300	$16,150	$32,300	$16,150	$ 7,500 - 32,300	$32,300	$41,675
1987	$27,860	$10,550	$32,950	$16,475	$32,950	$16,475	$ 7,500 - 32,950	$32,950	$42,510
1988	$28,695	$10,865	$33,935	$16,970	$33,935	$16,970	$ 7,500 - 33,935	$33,935	$43,785
1989	$28,695	$12,450	$35,290	17,650	$35,290	$17,650	$ 7,500 - 35,290	$35,290	$45,535

* For the years 1983, 1984 and 1985, Committee fees earned on average for each member for service on Committees were $8,300, $8,500, and $6,600 respectively. The "integrated annual indemnity" as referred to in the December 1, 1985 Report of the Commission of Inquiry was $26,956 for 1983, $27,900 for 1984 and $26,780 for 1985.

Appendix "E"
Table E-2

TABLE III

INDEMNITIES, ALLOWANCES AND SALARIES FOR ELECTED MEMBERS BY PROVINCE 1989-90

(Figures sourced from Provincial Legislatures as of October 31, 1989

	N.S.	N.B.	P.E.I.	NFLD.	QUE.	ONT.	MAN.	SASK.	ALTA.	B.C.
Year	1989	1989	1989	1989	1989	1989	1989	1989	1989	1989
Basic Indemnity	$28,695	$34,869	$19,200	$35,000	$55,058	$41,113	$26,782	$37,028	$38,335	$31,349
Expense Allowance	12,450	13,628	9,300	17,500	9,579	13,790	13,391	7,322	19,168	15,642
Salaries:										
Premier	49,535	46,561	46,000	50,778	57,811	50,640	26,600	52,300	59,850	45,000
Minister with Portfolio	35,290	31,042	35,300	38,815	41,294	30,094	20,600	36,610	47,853	39,000
Minister without Portfolio	Up to 35,290	23,282	N/A	N/A	N/A	15,111	15,600	36,610	28,914	25,000
Opposition Leader	35,290	31,042	35,300	38,815	41,294	35,267	20,600	36,610	47,853	39,000
Leader of Recognized Party	17,650	N/A	N/A	N/A	19,270	17,696	15,600	N/A	28,914	N/A
Speaker	35,290	31,042	10,000	38,815	41,294	22,214	15,500	20,920	47,853	39,000
Deputy Speaker	17,650	15,521	5,000	19,407	19,270	8,297	3,500	7,845	23,526	19,500

Appendix "g"
Table E-3

SUMMARY OF ADDITIONAL REMUNERATION FOR PARTICULAR RESPONSIBILITIES AND FOR COMMITTEE SERVICE IN THE LEGISLATURE BY PROVINCE

A. Particular Legislature Responsibilities (1969)

Responsibility	N.S.	N.B.	P.E.I.	NFLD.	QUE.	ONT.	MAN.	SASK.	ALTA.	B.C.
Parliamentary Assistant	-	-	-	$13,250	$11,012	$ 8,888	$2,500	$7,845	-	$6,000
Deputy Chair, C'tee of Whole	-	-	-	5,300	-	9,297	2,500	3,923	10,210	3,000
Standing C'tee, Chair	$500-$1500	-	-	5,000	19,270	5,036	-	3,923	-	-
Standing C'tee Vice Chair	-	-	-	4,000	11,012	-	-	-	-	-
House Leader	5,000	-	5,000	-	-	-	-	-	-	-
Deputy Gov't House Leader	3,000	-	-	-	11,012	-	-	-	-	-
Opposition House Leader	2,000	-	3,500	10,298	19,270	11,495	2,500	7,845	10,000	6,000
Deputy Opposition House Leader	-	-	-	-	8,259	-	-	-	-	-
3rd Party House Leader	-	-	-	-	-	8,852	-	-	8,000	-
Chief Gov't Whip	$85/mem.	1,500	3,000	6,135	19,270	11,495	2,500	7,845	8,000	6,000
Asst. Gov't Whip	-	-	-	-	7,918	7,878	-	3,923	6,000	3,000
Chief Opposition Whip	$85/mem.	-	3,000	6,135	16,517	7,878	2,500	7,845	6,000	6,000
Asst. Opposition Whip	-	-	-	-	8,259	5,882	-	3,923	5,000	-
Chief 3rd Party Whip	$85/mem.	-	-	-	5,506	6,458	-	-	5,000	-
Asst. 3rd Party Whip	-	-	-	-	-	5,166	-	-	-	-
Caucus Chairperson, each Party	$85/mem.	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	6,000

B. Remuneration for Committee Service (1968)

In addition to payments for Standing Committee Chairman and Vice-Chairman, noted above, the following summary reflects arrangements reported for service as Members on House Committees:

- per diem - Saskatchewan
- per diem paid when House not sitting in Newfoundland, P.E.I., Nova Scotia, Quebec, Manitoba and Alberta, and in Ontario similar payments when House not sitting or Committees meet away from legislature while the House is sitting.
- per diem expense allowance, non-accountable, paid in New Brunswick.
- estac.:shed by Order in Council for specific committees in British Columbia - Members usually receive no per diem for committee work.

APPENDIX "E"

TABLE E-4

SITTING DAYS PER SESSION OF THE NOVA SCOTIA LEGISLATURE 1970 - 1989

Year	Assembly	Session	Sitting Days
1970-71	50th Assembly	1st Session	40 days
1972		2nd Session	6 days
1973		3rd Session	57 days
1974		4th Session	52 days
1975-76	51st Assembly	5th Session	11 days
1976-77		1st Session	41 days
1977-78		2nd Session	69 days
1978		3rd Session	55 days
1978-79		4th Session	58 days
1980	52nd Assembly	5th Session	54 days
1981		1st Session	77 days
1982		2nd Session	64 days
1983	53rd Assembly	3rd Session	83 days
1984		1st Session	87 days
1985		2nd Session	64 days
1986	54th Assembly	3rd Session	67 days
1987		1st Session	50 days
1988		2nd Session	56 days
1989		3rd Session	59 days
		4th Session	56 days
	55th Assembly	1st Session	72 days

TOTAL DAYS OF EXTENDED HOURS 1983 - 1989

1983	33 days
1984	22 days
1985	16 days
1986	32 days
1987	22 days
1988	19 days
1989	28 days

Source: The Office of the Speaker of the House of Assembly.

APPENDIX "E"

TABLE E-5

AVERAGE SALARIES OF SELECTED PUBLIC SECTOR GROUPS NOVA SCOTIA, 1985 - 1989

	Year	Average Salary
DEPUTY MINISTERS	April 1, 1985	$73,492.
	March 30, 1986	$74,456.
	March 29, 1987	$77,027.
	March 27, 1988	&80,002.
	January 1, 1989	$84,172.
PROVINCIAL JUDGES	April 1, 1985	$60,000.
	April 1, 1986	$61,200.
	April 1, 1987	$63,036.
	April 1, 1988	$68,000.
	April 1, 1989	$89,000.
CIVIL SERVICE MANAGEMENT GROUP	April 1, 1985	$41,309.
	March 30, 1986	$42,136.
	March 29, 1987	$42,820.
	April 20, 1988	$43,297.
	January 1, 1989	$46,700.
TEACHERS**	August 1, 1985	$38,131.
	August 1, 1986	$38,064.
	August 1, 1987	$40,390.
	August 1, 1988	$41,977.
	N/A	
NURSES***	March 31, 1985	$29,130.
	March 30, 1986	$29,548.
	March 29, 1987	$29,614.
	April 20, 1988	$29,420.
	September 1, 1989	$30,509.

** This average includes all vocational and technical school teachers and also all supervisory allowances for principals and supervisors.

*** Currently under negotiation.

Source: Nova Scotia Civil Service Commission, November, 1989

APPENDIX "E"

TABLE E-6

CONSUMER PRICE INDEX FOR CANADA (ALL ITEMS)
1981 - 1989

(1981 = 100)

December	1981	104.7
December	1982	114.4
December	1983	119.6
December	1984	124.1
September	1985	128.0
September	1986	133.3
September	1987	139.3
September	1988	145.0
September	1989	152.6

Cumulative Increase: December 1981 to September, 1989:

47.9 index points or 45.7%.

Increase September 1988 to September 1989, All Items Index:

for Canada as a whole	7.6 points or 5.24%
for Halifax	7.6 points or 5.3%

Source: Statistics Canada, Consumer Prices and Price Indexes

APPENDIX "F"

Principles Relating to Remuneration and Support for Members and Ministers

Identified in Previous Reports of Commissions of Inquiry in Nova Scotia in 1977 and 1982

The primary rewards in an active life of service to the public are the opportunity to serve and contribute to the resolution of social problems and to the improvement of life for all in the province. In our meetings and discussions with elected members, and former members, we have been impressed with this vision by those who so serve, and by the sincerity with which they approach their task. As in an earlier report, we again underline our considered view that over the years Nova Scotia has been singularly blessed by the willingness of able people to take their part in public life. Many have done so at considerable personal sacrifice for themselves and their families. In recent years, as at other times when remuneration for service in office has fallen behind escalating costs, many have served at substantial financial cost to themselves both in direct costs exceeding their remuneration, sometimes to the extent of several thousands of dollars, and indirect losses of income that might be derived from business, professional practice or other activities if time were not so committed to service in government, the legislature and to constituents.

At any time the financial and other circumstances of life for members elected to the legislature will vary on a personal, individual basis. Fortunately, our legislators do not fit any mould and they represent constituencies which vary in size, in economic circumstances and in social standards. From a variety of backgrounds across the province they together provide assurance that our democratic processes ultimately will work to serve our own long-run interests.

While there is no "standard" M.L.A., we have the task of assessing standards for their remuneration. In our view, that task involves developing a standard for fair and reasonable indemnities, allowances and salaries based on certain principles. Those principles enunciated in previous reports include:

1) remuneration should be adequate in light of the time and responsibilities involved in office, and the risks of disruption of career and personal opportunities so that our political parties and their leaders, upon whom parliamentary government depends, may attract the most able persons among us to seek office and not deter the best of those elected from accepting and continuing full-time service in government;

2) remuneration should be reasonable so that the person who has no personal financial resources except through his vocational earnings, which may be terminated or seriously affected if he is elected, is not dissuaded from seeking office to serve the province merely because of financial circumstances;

3) remuneration should be adequate to ensure that M.L.A.'s and Ministers are supported without unfair financial sacrifice upon them or their families, particularly for those in their prime earning years when family and other obligations are likely to be heavy.

Remuneration and support that is fair and reasonable will not unduly encourage anyone interested primarily in financial reward for the balanced judgment of political parties and of the electorate can be counted upon to reject those not primarily interested in public service. Nor will such remuneration result in any significant financial advantage for any elected member who happens to be comparatively well-to-do, for our progressive income tax structure precludes that result.

APPENDIX "F" - Cont'd

In the application of these principles a number of factors have been taken into account in previous studies including

1) The evolving workload of M.L.A.'s, the House of Assembly and Ministers both in relation to legislative and governmental concerns of the province, and, for each member in service to constituents.

2) Changes in general economic circumstances since the last basic change in indemnities, allowances and salaries - e.g.

   - changes in inflation indexes.
   - changes in wages and salaries in the private and public sectors in the province.

3) Comparisons with levels of similar payments for service in the legislatures of other provinces of Canada.

House of Assembly
Nova Scotia

Report

Commission of Inquiry
on
Remuneration of Elected
Provincial Officials

November 24, 1989

(Members' Retiring Allowances Act)

Commission of Inquiry
on
Remuneration of Elected Provincial Officials

Commissioners:

George M. Mitchell, Q.C.
George L. White, LL.B.
Ian D. Robinson, CLU

Secretary to the Commission:
Joan M. Kelly

Post Office Box 2630
Station "M"
Halifax, N.S.
B3J 3N5

424-4432

November 24, 1989

The Honourable Arthur R. Donahoe
Speaker of the House of Assembly
Province House
Halifax, Nova Scotia

Dear Mr. Speaker:

We were appointed as Commissioners pursuant to Chapter 29 of the Statutes of Nova Scotia, 1983, to make an inquiry and a report respecting the allowances to be paid under the Members' Retiring Allowances Act.

Having completed the inquiry, in fulfilment of the commission assigned, we respectfully submit the accompanying report.

Yours sincerely,

George L. White
Commissioner

Ian D. Robinson
Commissioner

TABLE OF CONTENTS

		Page
I.	INTRODUCTION	1
II.	RETIRING ALLOWANCES IN NOVA SCOTIA	3
III.	COMPARISON WITH OTHER JURISDICTIONS	7
IV.	MATTERS REVIEWED	10
V.	SUMMARY OF RECOMMENDATIONS	19

APPENDICES

		Page
A.	Footnotes	23
B.	Letter of Appointment of Commission	24

I. INTRODUCTION

In accordance with Section 43A of the House of Assembly Act, the Speaker of the House appointed a Commission by letter dated August 28, 1989, "to make an inquiry and a report respecting the allowances to be paid under the Members' Retiring Allowances Act,"[1] (hereinafter referred to as "the Act").

In the course of the inquiry, the Commission followed the same procedure as outlined in the introduction of the foregoing Report of the Commission of Inquiry respecting the House of Assembly Act and the Executive Council Act. Some former Members of the Legislature have formed an Association of Former Members for the purposes of representing their views and making representations on their behalf on such matters as retiring allowances. Representatives of the Association, namely, Mr. James H. Vaughan and Mr. Glen M. Bagnell, met with the Commission for the purpose of reviewing concerns of the Association.

The Superintendent of Pensions for the Province of Nova Scotia, namely Mr. Percy Fleet and the Director of Public Service Pensions, Department of Finance, Mr. Gordon Sturdy, have been of great assistance to the Commission.

In accordance with our appointment, we are authorized under the House of Assembly Act to make "an inquiry and a report respecting allowances to be paid under the Members' Retiring Allowances Act". Accordingly, any Recommendations contained in this Report would be made with the expectation

they will be acted upon effective January 1, 1990, pursuant to Section 43A of the House of Assembly Act.

II. RETIRING ALLOWANCES IN NOVA SCOTIA

The Members' Retiring Allowances Act ("the Act") provides for a retirement allowance for Members of the Legislative Assembly. For this purpose, the Act establishes an account known as the "Members' Retiring Allowance Account". Members contribute and Government makes an equal contribution and credits interest on the balance in the account from time to time. The Act provides if at any time the account is insufficient to make payment provided under the Act, the account is then to be credited with sufficient funds for this purpose from the Consolidated Fund of the Province.

The "Members' Retiring Allowance Account" as it is referred to in the Act exists only as an accounting statement and does not represent a fund set aside for purposes of paying the retiring allowance. Therefore, the retiring allowance is unlike a pension scheme which is customarily funded from a plan established and maintained by the employer and employees. Nevertheless, the retiring allowance is a form of deferred payment and is presently treated as an employee pension plan for tax purposes.

The Act provides the Minister of Finance shall, as soon as possible after the end of each fiscal year, lay before the House of Assembly a report on the administration of the Act during the preceding fiscal year and shall include a statement of the amounts received by way of contributions and interest, the amounts paid by way of allowances, the number of

contributors, the number of persons receiving allowances, and such other information as the Governor-in-Council prescribes.

It should be noted that several changes have been made over time and the following summary describes the arrangements that now prevail:

> Eligibility for an allowance - a Member must contribute to the account and must have served in two General Assemblies for five years or more, must have attained age 55 and ceased to be a Member or be totally disabled, or have died in which case an allowance is payable to a surviving spouse and dependent children. By regulation a person otherwise qualified for an allowance but who has not reached the age of 55 years may elect to take an actuarially reduced pension at an earlier age than 55 years.
>
> Contribution by a Member - A Member contributes at the rate of 8% of the indemnity and annual allowance for expenses paid to him, and salaried Members and Ministers contribute 8% of the salary paid to them for their office.

Years of Contribution and Benefits - The maximum years of contribution to the plan are 15 years and for Members benefits accumulate, for each year of contribution and service, at the rate of 5% of the average annual indemnity and expense allowance during the last three years of service. The maximum benefit cannot exceed 75% of the average annual indemnity and expense allowance during the last three years of service. Salaried Members and Ministers are entitled to additional allowances accumulating at the same rate (5%) of the average salary payment for the three highest years of salaried service (or if salaried service is less than three years, then the average is that of the actual years served).

Benefits and the Impact of Inflation - By regulation under the Members Retiring Allowances Act, allowances paid have been increased in recent years by applying the same indexing factor as has been applied to pensions payable under the Public Service Superannuation Act. Thus former Members or their dependents paid an

allowance have the benefit of these arrangements to offset, in part at least, the impact of inflation on the benefits paid. Arrangements similar to these are also applied to those entitled to a deferred allowance, so that the deferred allowance increases in the same way as allowances being paid.

Survivors Benefits - Where a Member or a former Member entitled to an allowance dies, his or her surviving spouse is entitled to an allowance of 60% of the allowance payable to the deceased and for each dependent child this ratio is increased by 10% to a maximum of 40% of the allowance.

III. COMPARISON WITH OTHER JURISDICTIONS

It is common practice in all legislative jurisdictions in Canada to provide for retiring allowances for former members of the legislature and additional allowances for those who have served in salaried offices, for example, the Prime Minister, Premier, Ministers, Speaker, and Leader of the Opposition. These plans reflect the need to provide adequately for those who have served in elected office, often during their most productive years, usually at the price of foregoing other career opportunities, and generally, once elected are dependent upon the will of the electorate more than on the individual's decision for continuance in elected office.

Arrangements do differ somewhat from one legislative jurisdiction to another, most particularly in relation to:

1) the contribution rate of Members - from 7% in Manitoba and Newfoundland to 11% in the case of the Parliament of Canada;

2) the component of remuneration on which the allowance and contributions are based - in the case of the Parliament of Canada and three Legislatures it is the indemnity only, and in the case of seven others, including Nova Scotia, it is the indemnity and general allowance;

3) the age or formula of age plus years of service at which one qualifies for an allowance, having ceased to be a Member - some jurisdictions have no age requirements, while others utilize a formula of age plus years of service, while others provide for a minimum age before payments can be commenced:

No age requirement

Parliament of Canada

New Brunswick

Years of service plus age

Ontario - years of service plus age equals 55, or upon attaining age 50

Newfoundland - years of service plus age equals 60, for Premier 55

British Columbia - years of service plus age equals 60, or upon attaining age 55

Manitoba - years of service plus age equals 55

Quebec - years of service plus age equals 65 (service after 1/1/88 plus age equals 50)

Age Requirement

Prince Edward Island - age 50

Saskatchewan - age 50

Alberta - age 55

Nova Scotia - age 55

4) the annual rate of accumulation of the allowance and the maximum ratio of allowance to remuneration - here a number of other jurisdictions are roughly comparable to Nova Scotia at a rate of 5% for each year of service for a maximum ratio of 75% of remuneration paid before retirement although arrangements do vary from jurisdiction to jurisdiction.

5) arrangements for a surviving spouse and dependent children - most jurisdictions have arrangements for a reduced payment to a surviving spouse or dependent although the amount and method of determination varies.

IV. MATTERS REVIEWED

Retirement plans for elected governmental officials in Canada are in most instances more generous than standard private or public sector career pension plans. Their retiring allowance is intended to provide some form of financial security for those who serve in elected office. Elected officials interrupt their private life careers, often at considerable financial sacrifice, to serve as Members of the Legislature. Their service is without the security of tenure and in fact is often episodic, lacking longevity. In order to properly compensate for the resultant financial insecurity and losses, your Commissioners are of the view that retiring allowances to Members must be governed by rules and benefit provisions which are often different from those found in prescribed pension plans. As previously indicated, the obligations for payment of retiring allowances under the Act are not fully funded, nor should such be expected.

Nevertheless, consideration of any changes to the arrangements for retiring allowances should be tempered by recognition of a prevailing effort by governments to exercise fiscal restraint and responsibility. The Commissioners are pleased to note that officials of the Department of Finance are in the process of receiving advice from actuaries and consultants pertaining to certain financial and administrative aspects of the retiring allowances. We also understand, as noted in last year's report of the Commission of Inquiry, that

adequate administrative provisions will be made for expected Federal changes affecting pension plans.

Equity - Between Members and former Members - is also an important principle and criteria for consideration when assessing the appropriateness of recommendations for changes to the retirement arrangements. There have been many changes to the Act over a period of several years and it is important to assess the fairness of the impact of these changes to those who served at different times in the past. Reforms of recent years have tended to benefit those who have served more recently, while failing to redress resultant inequities to former Members or their surviving spouses and dependents.

It is fundamentally important that service in the House of Assembly, through the nomination and election process, be accessible to the largest portion of the population as reasonably possible. The retiring allowance provisions must be seen, by those who could potentially serve, as offering an appropriate level of financial security to prospective members and their dependent families.

After careful consideration of these guiding principles, your Commissioners make a number of recommendations.

Approximately 19 former Members, surviving spouses or dependents are currently in receipt of monthly payments of less than $500. A considerable number of these, are in fact, receiving less than $250 per month under the Act. The Commissioners are of the opinion that, taking into account the effects of erosion and the level of entitlements currently being earned, these payments are inequitably low and therefore recommend:

MRA R 89 - 1

> The total minimum amount of all allowances paid on or after January 1, 1990, under this Act in respect of a former Member, whether paid to the former Member, the surviving spouse of the former Member, children or dependents of the former Member or any combination thereof shall be not less than $500 per month notwithstanding the total amount of such payments as would otherwise be determined in accordance with the Act. Provided however, for the purpose of determining the actuarily reduced level of allowance in accordance with MRA R 89-8 herein, the reduction Factor shall apply to the greater of (i) $500 per month, or (ii) the allowance as otherwise determined.

Since January 1, 1969, Members were required to contribute 8% of their annual indemnities towards the retiring allowance. As of January 1, 1982, the annual allowance for expenses was added to the base and members were required to contribute at the rate of 8%. By virtue of R-4 of the Commission of Inquiry report dated December 1, 1986, Members or former Members were entitled to make back payment for contribution in respect of their annual expense allowances for the period January 1, 1969 to December 31, 1981 within a time

limit as prescribed in R-4. As an administrative matter, we understand that some members or former members may not have utilized the opportunity for back payment. The Commissioners therefore recommend:

MRA R 89 - 2

> As of January 1, 1990, there no longer be a time limitation within which payments may be made by a Member, former Member, a spouse, children or dependents of a former Member in respect of R-4 of the Report dated December 1, 1986, made by the Nova Scotia Commission of Inquiry on Remuneration of Elected Provincial Officials.

Since January 1, 1969, certain members, who served in the office as Premier, member of the Executive Council, Leader of the Opposition, Leader of a Recognized Party, Speaker or Deputy Speaker, were required to make a contribution of 4% of their annual salary and in turn, subject to the usual provisions of the Act, would be entitled to an additional retiring allowance in respect of their salary for holding any such office. However, on January 1, 1982, the amount of the contribution rate was increased to 8%, with a corresponding change in the benefit entitlement. As a result of this change in the contribution rate from 4% to 8% in respect of the salary for these certain Members, Section 6A(1A) provided an opportunity for back payment with corresponding adjustment in entitlement under Section 8(2)(c)(ii). However, this opportunity for back payment applied only to those persons who were Members of the House at the time 6A(1A) was enacted. This appears to be inequitable

since former members were not afforded the opportunity to utilize the same back payment provision. Accordingly, the Commissioners recommend:

MRA R 89 - 3

> On or after January 1, 1990, any Member, former Member, surviving spouse, children or dependents of a former Member, whether in receipt of an additional allowance under Sub-section 8(2) of the Act or entitled to a deferred allowance in respect of Sub-section 8(2) of the Act, be permitted, to the extent that the Member, former Member, surviving spouse, children or dependents of the former Member has not already done so, to make the payment as is provided pursuant to 6A(1A) of the Act and in respect of such person who has made such contribution, Sub-section 8(2) shall be read, for the purpose of payment of allowances subsequent to the later of January 1, 1990, or such date as the person elects to make such contribution, as if the contribution had been made pursuant to 6A(1A).

Section 11 of the Act provides an allowance shall be discontinued while the person to whom it is payable is a Member of the House. However, since Revenue Canada provides that payments under an employee pension plan must commence no later than the 1st day of the month following the 71st birthday of an employee, a technical repugnancy exists where the sitting member of the House, having attained the age of 71 years, is unable to be paid by virtue of Section 11 of the Act. It is therefore recommended:

MRA R 89 - 4

> On or after January 1, 1990, a Member, otherwise entitled to an allowance pursuant to the Act, shall be entitled to be paid such allowance or allowances commencing on the first day of the month immediately following his 71st birthday, notwithstanding Section 11 of the Act. Further, any person who is a Member on January 1, 1990, and is 71 years of age or older, shall be entitled to a lump sum payment equal to the amount of allowance or allowances to which he would have been entitled if this recommendation had been in effect at the time of his 71st birthday.

Another anomaly in the Act arises from the fact that although a contribution and entitlement applies in respect of the salary of the Premier, the same does not apply to the representation allowance paid to the Premier under the authority of regulation of the Legislature Internal Economy Board. The Commissioners have determined that this has been taxable income and should therefore be pensionable. It is therefore recommended:

MRA R 89 - 5

> Subject to payment of applicable contribution by the Member pursuant to Sub-section 6(2) of the Act, the representation allowance paid to the Member who was Premier for the years 1982 to 1989, be included in the calculation of the average salary of that Member for purposes of determining the amount of the allowance to be paid pursuant to Sub-section 8(2) of the Act.

Since January 1, 1976, allowances which have been paid (including those that commenced before January 1, 1976) have been indexed on an annual basis to make at least a partial offset against the increase in the cost of living. The adjustment was applied only to those years during which

the payment was being made. Consequently, the report dated December 1, 1983 of the Commission of Inquiry recommended that the deferred retiring allowance be adjusted in the same manner, commencing effective January 1, 1984. However, an apparent inequity exists since the deferred retiring allowance applicable for any time prior to January 1, 1984, remains frozen. The Commissioners therefore recommend:

> MRA R 89 - 6
>
> For purposes of determining the amount of any allowances paid pursuant to the Act on or after January 1, 1990, the amount of the deferred retiring allowance, including portions of the allowance provided pursuant to Sub-section 8(2) of the Act, to which any Member or former Member was entitled during and including January 1, 1976 to December 31, 1986, or any part thereof, be determined as if Schedule "B" of Order in Council no. 75-342 applied to it.

Only one other province, namely Alberta, requires that a former Member must attain the age of 55 before being entitled to the full benefit of his earned retiring allowance. All other provinces either provide for a normal retirement date of 50 years of age, or a formula of age plus years of service which would entitle many former Members who had served for 5 or 10 years and attained the age of 50 to receive the retirement allowance. A former Member whose political life is at an end, having served the public during his most marketable years, is often not in a position to begin a satisfying new career. Further, the stigma of being a defeated Member or former politician may add to the difficulties of finding

suitable alternate employment opportunities. The Commissioners therefore recommend:

MRA R 89-7

On or after January 1, 1990, allowances commence to be paid as if Section 7 referred to the age of 50 years and Sub-section 9(b) referred to 50 years of age and all other provisions in the Act or recommendations of the Report of earlier Commissions of Inquiry referred to the age of 50 years in place of 55 years.

Section 15(c) of the Act provides for payment of an allowance at an actuarily reduced level to or in respect of a Member before attaining normal retirement age. Actuarial consultants to the Department of Finance have advised that the current provisions no longer correspond to current Revenue Canada provisions. Accordingly, it is recommended:

MRA R 89 - 8

A Member who ceases to be a Member before attaining age 50, or a former Member who is under the age of 50, and, in either case, would if he had attained age 50 be entitled to an allowance pursuant to the provisions of the Act, may elect to be paid an allowance at a reduced level. The reduced level allowance shall be calculated by determining the allowance to which the Member would be entitled at age 50 years and multiplying that allowance by the Factor for his present age shown opposite the ages in the following Table. For non-integral ages the Factor shall be calculated from the Factors for the integral ages above and below the actual age of linear interpolation. This recommendation shall apply in respect of payments made on or after January 1, 1990. Notwithstanding this Recommendation, a person who is a former Member on January 1, 1990, and has been in receipt of an actuarily reduced allowance pursuant to Sub-section 15(c) of the Act prior to January 1, 1990, either (i) shall have payments made on or after January 1, 1990 recalculated based on the age that the existing allowance commenced substituting the applicable

Table; or (ii) shall, in lieu of the actuarily reduced allowance, be paid a full allowance pursuant to MRA R 89-7 commencing January 1, 1990 if he otherwise qualifies pursuant to that Recommendation.

TABLE OF
EARLY RETIREMENT ADJUSTMENT FACTORS TO PENSION

"NORMAL" RETIREMENT AGE 50

Age	Factor
40	69.5%
41	71.7%
42	74.3%
43	76.9%
44	79.7%
45	82.5%
46	85.7%
47	89.0%
48	92.4%
49	96.1%
50	100.0%

The improved and updated provisions for payment of Members' retiring allowances as contained in the recommendations of this Report, will provide better security and less financial interruption to those who are elected by the public to serve in the Legislature. However, in times of financial restraint and public accountability, the recommendations should be accompanied by an increased contribution from the Members. Your Commissioners recommend:

MRA R 89 - 9

Contribution payments required to be made into the Consolidated Fund pursuant to Sections 5, 6, and 6A of the Act for future service on or after January 1, 1990 shall be increased to the rate of ten percent (10%).

V. SUMMARY OF RECOMMENDATIONS

The Commissioners make the following recommendations in their Report, after inquiry, respecting allowances to be paid under the Members Retiring Allowances Act:

MRA R 89 - 1

The total minimum amount of all allowances paid on or after January 1, 1990, under this Act in respect of a former Member, whether paid to the former Member, the surviving spouse of the former Member, children or dependents of the former Member or any combination thereof shall be not less than $500 per month notwithstanding the total amount of such payments as would otherwise be determined in accordance with the Act. Provided however, for the purpose of determining the actuarily reduced level of allowance in accordance with MRA R 89-8 herein, the reduction Factor shall apply to the greater of (i) $500 per month, or (ii) the allowance as otherwise determined. (page 12)

MRA R 89 - 2

As of January 1, 1990, there no longer be a time limitation within which payments may be made by a Member, former Member, a spouse, children or dependents of a former Member in respect of R-4 of the Report dated December 1, 1986, made by the Nova Scotia Commission of Inquiry on Remuneration of Elected Provincial Officials. (page 13)

MRA R 89 - 3

On or after January 1, 1990, any Member, former Member, surviving spouse, children or dependents of a former Member, whether in receipt of an additional allowance under Sub-section 8(2) of the Act or entitled to a deferred allowance in respect of Sub-section 8(2) of the Act, be permitted, to the extent that the Member, former Member, surviving spouse, children or dependents of the former Member has not already done so, to make the payment as is provided pursuant to 6A(1A) of the Act and in respect of such person who has made such contribution, Sub-section 8(2) shall be read, for the purpose of payment of allowances subsequent to the later of January 1,

1990, or such date as the person elects to make such contribution, as if the contribution had been made pursuant to 6A(1A). (page 14)

MRA R 89 - 4

On or after January 1, 1990, a Member, otherwise entitled to an allowance pursuant to the Act, shall be entitled to be paid such allowance or allowances commencing on the first day of the month immediately following his 71st birthday, notwithstanding Section 11 of the Act. Further, any person who is a Member on January 1, 1990, and is 71 years of age or older, shall be entitled to a lump sum payment equal to the amount of allowance or allowances to which he would have been entitled if this recommendation had been in effect at the time of his 71st birthday. (page 15)

MRA R 89 - 5

Subject to payment of applicable contribution by the Member pursuant to Sub-section 6(2) of the Act, the representation allowance paid to the Member who was Premier for the years 1982 to 1989, be included in the calculation of the average salary of that Member for purposes of determining the amount of the allowance to be paid pursuant to Sub-section 8(2) of the Act. (page 15)

MRA R 89 - 6

For purposes of determining the amount of any allowances paid pursuant to the Act on or after January 1, 1990, the amount of the deferred retiring allowance, including portions of the allowance provided pursuant to Sub-section 8(2) of the Act, to which any Member or former Member was entitled during and including January 1, 1976 to December 31, 1986, or any part thereof, be determined as if Schedule "B" of Order in Council no. 75-342 applied to it. (page 16)

MRA R 89 - 7

On or after January 1, 1990, allowances commence to be paid as if Section 7 referred to the age of 50 years and Sub-section 9(b) referred to 50 years of age and all other provisions in the Act or recommendations of the Report of earlier Commissions

of Inquiry referred to the age of 50 years in place of 55 years. (page 17)

MRA R 89 - 8

A Member who ceases to be a Member before attaining age 50, or a former Member who is under the age of 50, and, in either case, would if he had attained age 50 be entitled to an allowance pursuant to the provisions of the Act, may elect to be paid an allowance at a reduced level. The reduced level allowance shall be calculated by determining the allowance to which the Member would be entitled at age 50 years and multiplying that allowance by the Factor for his present age shown opposite the ages in the following Table. For non-integral ages the Factor shall be calculated from the Factors for the integral ages above and below the actual age of linear interpolation. This recommendation shall apply in respect of payments made on or after January 1, 1990. Notwithstanding this Recommendation, a person who is a former Member on January 1, 1990, and has been in receipt of an actuarily reduced allowance pursuant to Sub-section 15(c) of the Act prior to January 1, 1990, either (i) shall have payments made on or after January 1, 1990 recalculated based on the age that the existing allowance commenced substituting the applicable Factor in the following Table; or (ii) shall in lieu of the actuarily reduced allowance, be paid a full allowance pursuant to MRA R 89-7 commencing January 1, 1990 if he otherwise qualifies pursuant to that Recommendation.

TABLE OF
EARLY RETIREMENT ADJUSTMENT FACTORS TO PENSION
"NORMAL" RETIREMENT AGE 50

Age	Factor
40	69.5%
41	71.7%
42	74.3%
43	76.9%
44	79.7%
45	82.5%
46	85.7%
47	89.0%
48	92.4%
49	96.1%
50	100.0%

(page 17)

MRA R 89 - 9

Contribution payments required to be made into the Consolidated Fund pursuant to Sections 5, 6, and 6A of the Act for future service on or after January 1, 1990 shall be increased to the rate of ten percent (10%). (page 18)

APPENDIX "A"

FOOTNOTES

1. R.S.N.S. 1967, c. 181, as amended.

APPENDIX "B"

The Speaker

House of Assembly
Nova Scotia

PO Box 1617
Halifax, Nova Scotia
B3J 2Y3

902 424-5707

August 28, 1989

Mr. George White, LL.B.
Patterson Kitz
Barristers and Solicitors
P. O. Box 1068
Truro, Nova Scotia
B2N 5B9

and

Mr. Ian D. Robinson
6313 Cornwall Street
Halifax, Nova Scotia
B3H 2J2

Gentlemen:

This will confirm your appointment as Commissioners pursuant to Chapter 29 of the Statutes of Nova Scotia, 1983, to make an enquiry and a report respecting the allowances to be paid under the Members' Retiring Allowances Act.

I thank you for your willingness to undertake these duties and can assure you of the full co-operation of the Office of the Speaker in carrying out your work.

I look forward to receiving your report on or before December 1, 1989 as required by the Act.

Yours very truly,

Arthur R. Donahoe
Speaker

ARD:nk